



**COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
43500 MONTEREY AVE
PALM DESERT, CA 92260
THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2014**

- I. Chair Broughton called the meeting to order at 9:37 am and asked Trustee Stefan to lead the pledge of allegiance.

Dr. Kinnamon – Dr. Kinnamon conducted the roll call:

Trustee Broughton

Trustee O’Neill

Trustee Stefan

Trustee Sanchez-Fulton (early departure, 10:30 a.m.)

Trustee Wilson

Student Trustee Campbell

Parliamentarian – Carlos Maldonado

Recorder – Angela Walton

II. CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

Trustee Stefan pulled Administrative Consent Agenda Administrative Services Item 1, 1(a), Purchase Orders in excess of \$25,000, for discussion. Trustee Broughton pulled Consent Agenda Administrative Services Item 7, Change Orders, Measure B Bond Projects, items 19 & 20, for Mecca/Thermal campus, for discussion. Student Trustee Campbell asked to pull Consent Agenda Student Success/Student Learning Item 1, Approval of Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015, for discussion.

Motion: Motion by Trustee Wilson, seconded by Trustee Sanchez Fulton to approve the amendments to the agenda.

Discussion – none

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: none

Absent: none

Abstain: none

Motion carried unanimously. The agenda stands approved as amended.

III. CLOSED SESSION

1. CONFERENCE WITH LABOR NEGOTIATOR, Pursuant to Section 54957.6; unrepresented groups & labor unions on campus include CTA, CODAA, and CSEA Agency Designated Representative: Dr. Joel L. Kinnamon
2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL ANTICIPATED LITIGATION: Section 54956.9 (d)(2/3/4) Specify number of potential cases: 6
3. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATORS: Property: Parcel Numbers: 669 330 047, 611 211 002, 611 211 008, 611 211 009, 611 211 010, 611 211 015, 717 270 016, 717 270 017, 717 270 020, 717 270 227, 502 190 003, 502 190 004, 502 190 008, 502 190 015, 502 190 019, 502 190 020

IV. OPEN SESSION

Closed Session report – Trustee Broughton stated that no reportable action was taken in closed session.

V. PUBLIC COMMENTS

1. Frank Yturralde, IV, Student – spoke on behalf of the COD Veteran Student Association. Mr. Yturralde stated that Trustee Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton has been involved in several COD events, most recently the Veteran’s Day ceremonies. The COD Veterans Association signed a petition requesting Mr. Yturralde to submit a letter of concern to the Board of Trustees as well as address the COD Board of Trustees over their concerns of Trustee Sanchez-Fulton’s disingenuous participation in their COD events. Mr. Yturralde read his letter to the Board of Trustees. The Board members thanked Mr. Yturralde and the COD Veterans Association for his openness in speaking on this matter.

Mr. Yturralde, IV’s Letter:

On behalf of the COD Student Veterans Organization,

I am writing to apprise whomever it may concern of a situation that has been occurring and reoccurring involving a member of the Board of Trustees. Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton has been involved in several events put on by the SVO in the last couple years, specifically our Veterans Day Ceremonies and our participation in the Palm Springs Veterans Day Parades.

At least, that is the impression once would get if they were to come to one of these events. The reality of the situation is my members (myself included) put in exceptional efforts in bringing these events together and then quite literally moments before the event begins Sanchez-Fulton shows up to associate herself with our efforts in a very gauche

manner. She puts herself physically in front of my members. She leaps at opportunities for photos, again in front of my members. All of this under this under the stated purpose of “supporting the vets”.

To be blunt, veterans can smell disingenuousness two towns over. Sanchez-Fulton comes off as that in spades. She doesn't appear to view us as anything more than a convenient photo opportunity. This is particularly awkward given that our events are primarily held to honor not only ourselves, but our fellows both deployed downrange and those six feet underground.

In my affairs I have dealt with enough self-aggrandizing politicians that these sort of shenanigans do not really bother me. Even things like the stern talking to she gave me after my veterans day speech, for apparently forgetting to thank her by name, despite not having crossed paths with her once in my several month long preparation period. Or, her mentioning rather loudly how the other members of the board weren't there “supporting” us. I try to ignore these things. However, I came into my office today to be presented with a several page petition signed by essentially my entire active organization. I was questioned by my members as to whom exactly this person that that shoved her way into the parade was. I explained her position in the school and I and some of the older members recalled the past incidents. My members then asked me to write this letter.

It is perhaps a bit easy to run afoul of a few of my guys. Vets are a uniquely hotheaded bunch. However until now I have yet to see someone run afoul of nearly all of my guys. I understand the sentiment. It is annoying to have someone tell you how much they support you whilst simultaneously using you as a political tool.

*Above All,
Frant Yturralde, IV
President,
COD Student Veterans Organization*

2. Matt Monica, Public – Mr. Monica thanked everyone who participated in the November 4 election. Mr. Monica also commended the architectural club on their participation in golf cart parade. Mr. Monica congratulated Trustee Broughton and Trustee Wilson on winning another four years, and commended the Alumni Board on the Hall of Fame awards. Mr. Monica complimented the work of Donni Prince. He also read his candidate letter and stated if he can ever assist the Board or Dr. Kinnamon, he is always willing.
3. Lauro Jimenez, Staff – Consent Item Human Resources Item #6, Memorandum of Understanding Between Desert Community College District and California School Employees' Association and its Chapter #407 – Mr. Jimenez requested to address this item prior to the Board's vote on this consent agenda item.
4. Jennifer Andi, Student – Vice President of Active Minds Chapter at COD, requested that COD fill the full-time psychologist position that has not been

occupied since last year, and expressed how not having these mental health services negatively affects the student population in need of these services.

5. Anna Reber-Frantz, Faculty, with Giorgina Wiant, Student - Ms. Wiant gave her time to Anna Reber-Frantz, who was joined by several students from the nursing department. Ms. Reber-Frantz addressed their current department struggles with a letter to the Board of Trustees and list of concerns:
6. Heather Benes, Faculty – English teacher – concerned about the quality of education as well as the concern of COD only using one committee to hire several deans for different disciplines. She requested COD look into developing appropriate hiring committees.

VI. INTRODUCTION OF NEW FULL-TIME STAFF

Dr. Kinnamon introduced three new COD employees, Brandon Toepfer (Supervisor of Maintenance and Grounds), Danielle Krol (Director of Library and Learning Resources), and Julie Carlson (Executive Administrative Assistant, President’s Office). The Board of Trustees welcomed the new employees to COD.

VII. MINUTES

There were no corrections to the minutes of October 17, 2014, and they stand approved.

VIII. REPORTS

- A. ASCOD – John Zepeda, ASCOD President, was present and gave a brief report.
- B. College of the Desert Foundation – Donna Jean Darby was present and gave a brief report.
- C. College of the Desert Alumni Association – no report
- D. Academic Senate – Douglas Redmond was present and gave a brief report.
- E. CODFA – Denise Diamond was present and gave a brief report.
- F. CODAA – Cathy Levitt was present and gave a brief report.

At this time, Matt Monica asked to make a special announcement that he will be meeting on November 25 with Eduardo Garcia, Assembly Member Elect for District 56.

- G. CSEA – Lauro Jimenez was present and gave a brief report.
- H. Governing Board

Trustee O’Neill – Offered congratulations to Trustee Broughton and Trustee Wilson, and thanked Matt Monica and Michael McCabe for their devotion to COD. Trustee O’Neill reported that he attended a 2X2 meeting with Dr. Kinnamon, Trustee Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Desert Hot Springs mayor and city council members, and the meeting was regarding moving forward on COD expansion into Desert Hot Springs. He reported the meeting was positive and is looking forward increasing COD presence in West Valley. Trustee O’Neill thanked the veterans for their service and stated that it is good for the Board members to hear what was reported to them on the Veterans Day events. Trustee O’Neill reported that the CCLC conference is starting today, stating COD is one of many colleges who will be serving as a host for the conference, and he thanked all who will be taking a part in the conference. Trustee O’Neill reported he attended a Health and Welfare Committee meeting as a retiree representative and thanked everyone who participates in that committee, and stated that everyone is working diligently on behalf of the COD community. Trustee O’Neill congratulated all of COD’s sports teams and the women’s golf team for their championship. Trustee O’Neill reported that the Desert Sun recently ran a COD series, and hoped that the information was captured in our archives for historical purposes. Trustee O’Neill reported that he did not attend the Foundation meeting October, but distributed the following information to the Board of Trustees: amended and restated bylaws, financial statements as of September 30, 2014, request for funding from 30/30 campaign, of which the Foundation raised 3.7 million, and goals for Foundation and strategic planning.

Trustee O’Neill mentioned an article in last Sunday’s paper that addressed the demographics and Foundation of La Guardia Community College in Queens. Trustee O’Neill stated his interest in the article because of the recent endowment of \$100,000 to La Guardia Community College by its Foundation which was the largest endowment received by that college. Comparatively, similar institutions of its size typically received endowments in the millions, including COD, due to the unique geographic location of COD and demographics of our area. Trustee O’Neill stated that the Foundation benefits the students and COD’s ability to provide for its students. He wished everyone a happy Thanksgiving.

Trustee Wilson – Thanked the community for their support during the election. Trustee Wilson reported that she submitted her resignation to CVAG and is retiring to devote more time to the college. Trustee Wilson thanked her campaign team and volunteers for helping her walk the district while she was campaigning. Trustee Wilson stated that there is support and concern for the college from the community and she will continue to work with the college on addressing those concerns. She thanked all again for the great support she received during the voting. Trustee Wilson stated that she and her late husband were community college graduates and she briefly shared his story.

Trustee Sanchez – Fulton – absent (early departure, 10:30 am)

Trustee Stefan – Trustee Stefan reported that she is involved with her local union which has an “Adopt a Highway” program that she has participated in the past two Saturdays. Last Saturday she attended the annual Fall Book Sale at COD that was sponsored by Friends of the Library, and she also stopped by street fair. Trustee Stefan reported on open houses at her school and at her local union office in La Quinta. Trustee Stefan reported she attended the Hall of Fame event, and was impressed by all the names of people who have supported COD throughout its history. The scholarship recipients were outstanding and she enjoyed spending time with them. Trustee Stefan reported that she attended COD’s homecoming as well. She thanked our veteran students and stated she has a great respect for them as her daughter and son-in-law are both active duty military members. Trustee Stefan stated that Board members should be behind the scenes and should be here to support staff and students, and apologized on behalf of the Board for any offense.

Student Trustee Campbell – Student Trustee Campbell reported that she recently attended a Community Colleges California Student Affairs Association conference, where they were taught about customer service and how to reach out to our constituents; social media and professionalism were also major topics at the conference. She offered congratulations to Trustee Broughton and Trustee Wilson, and she feels they will continue do a great job. Student Trustee Campbell reported she visited the Living Desert, where they studied native plants and how the Indians lived, and took pictures of their huts and items they used to prepare their foods. Student Trustee Campbell reported she worked at North Palm Springs polling place during the elections. She also attended the General Assembly Conference Advisors Round Table with Carlos Maldonado, Director of Student Services, where they were taught how to view things from the students and advisors perspectives. Student Trustee Campbell also attended Students Next Chapter, where the issues of policy and shared governance were discussed. She reported she met with one of the soccer coaches and several soccer students, walked the field and discussed improvements in the soccer field.

Trustee Broughton – Trustee Broughton stated that the Board appreciates the work of the Student Trustee and appreciates the time it takes, and thanked her for her work.

Trustee Broughton apologized to the COD Veterans on behalf of the Board of Trustees and thanked them for bringing the issue of Trustee Sanchez-Fulton to their attention. Trustee Broughton addressed the COD Veterans day event, stating that the Board has discussed the appropriate level of participation the Board of Trustees members should have in campus events.

Trustee Broughton stated that she is thankful the election is over and she thanked the candidates and the community for allowing her to continue for another term and she will work hard to represent both her community and the students of the Coachella Valley. Trustee Broughton reported she attended Give Big Riverside, a first time fundraiser for non-profits. Trustee Broughton stated she runs into outstanding students from COD out in the community and that they have been impressive, and thanked the college community for all the hard work they do.

Michael O'Neill asked that the Code of Conduct the Board adopts is reviewed.

- I. **Superintendent/President** – Dr. Kinnamon thanked Bert Bitanga for their entry in the golf cart parade, and congratulated him for winning an award. Dr. Kinnamon thanked everyone who participated in the recent Palm Springs Pride Parade, and congratulated the women's golf team on their recent accomplishment of winning the state championship. Dr. Kinnamon reported that he as well as several Board members and staff members will be attendees of the annual Community College League of California conference, which is a good opportunity for professional development. Dr. Kinnamon reported that COD has scheduled two scoping meetings for the West Valley campus at the Palm Springs Library at 10 am and 2 pm this Saturday. The purpose of the meetings are to give the community an opportunity to give their input on the planned expansion. Dr. Kinnamon reported that COD won the Desert Energy "Green California" Schools and Community Colleges award for curriculum and congratulated the department, sharing the award with the Board members as well as information on the program.

IX. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Human Resources

1. Employment Group C Appointments
2. Employment Group A Appointments
3. Resignations
4. Working Out of Class
5. Approval of the 2015-2016 Holiday Schedule
6. Memorandum of Understanding Between Desert Community College District and California School Employees' Association and Its Chapter #407

B. Administrative Services

1. ~~Purchase Orders and Contracts for Supplies, Services and Construction~~ *Pulled for discussion*
2. Warrants
3. Approval of Contracts/Agreements and Amendments
4. Payroll
5. Out-of-State/Country Travel

- 6. Amendments to Contracts – Measure B Bond Projects
- 7. ~~Change Orders—Measure B Bond Projects~~ *Pulled for discussion*
- 8. Budget Transfers

C. Student Success/Student Learning

- 1. ~~Approval of Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015~~ *Pulled for discussion*

Motion: Motion by Trustee Stefan, seconded by Trustee O’Neill to approve the consent agenda with exception to the items pulled for discussion. Trustee Broughton reminded all that the items pulled were Consent Agenda Administrative Services Item 1, 1(a), Purchase Orders in excess of \$25,000, Consent Agenda Administrative Services Item 7, Change Orders, Measure B Bond Projects, items 19 & 20, Mecca/Thermal change orders, and Consent Agenda Student Success/Student Learning Item 1, Approval of Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015.

Discussion – Lauro Jimenez asked to address the Board at this time on the MOU between DCCD and CSEA. Mr. Jimenez referenced an earlier public comment regarding the nursing department and stated that this was an area in the CSEA contract where they were able to move forward with regard to a faculty position; this position was formerly held by a classified staff member who took the early retirement incentive. CSEA has been in the process of reclassifying the position at the request of the District. All aspects of the position have been reviewed to comply with new technologies and education requirements, as well as making sure the position was appropriately compensated so the students would benefit. CSEA and DCCD have reached an agreement, and they would like to move forward with posting this position after Board approval.

Carlos Maldonado, Parliamentarian, recommended pulling all consent items for discussion and addressing them as an action items in the future.

Vote:

- Yes:** Becky Broughton, Michael O’Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell
- No:** none
- Absent:** Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton
- Abstain:** none

Motion carried unanimously. The consent agenda stands approved as amended.

X. CLOSED SESSION (Cont’d)

4. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

- Superintendent/President

XI. OPEN SESSION

Closed Session Report:

Trustee Broughton reported that no reportable action was taken in closed session.

XII. ACTION AGENDA

A. Items Pulled from Consent Agenda for Separate Discussion and Consideration.

Trustee Stefan pulled Administrative Consent Agenda Item 1, 1(a), Purchase Orders in excess of \$25,000, for discussion. Trustee Broughton pulled Consent Agenda Item 7, items 19 & 20 Mecca/Thermal items change orders, for discussion. Student Trustee Campbell pulled Consent Agenda Item Student Services/Student Learning Item 1, Approval of Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015, for discussion.

Motion: Motion by Trustee Stefan, seconded by Trustee O'Neill to approve Purchase Orders in excess of \$25,000.

Discussion – Trustee Stefan asked Lisa Howell, VP Administrative Services, to address the purchase orders, which Ms. Howell reported were larger than normal due to the utilization of the 30/30 campaign. Purchase orders over \$750,000 were issued. Trustee O'Neill stated it was nice to see the fire services program get the items they needed. Student Trustee Campbell asked if any of these funds would be put toward the soccer field. Lisa Howell reported that Brandon Toepfer, the new supervisor of Maintenance and Grounds, is currently performing assessments of all of the areas and that she has forwarded the concerns about the soccer field to him.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson, Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: none

Absent: Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

Abstain: none

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved as presented.

Motion: Motion made by Trustee Broughton, seconded by Trustee Stefan to approve Consent Agenda Administrative Change Orders, Measure B Bond Projects, items 19 & 20, for Mecca/Thermal campus.

Discussion – Lisa Howell reported that there was an approved contract with Dyno Electric to provide additional cameras to Mecca/Thermal campus. Lt. Misti Reynolds and her staff reviewed the plan and worked with COD staff on the approved changes, and they will come back out and assist with the implementation of the cameras at the Mecca/Thermal Campus. Trustee Broughton said she feels that our students will be

safer. Trustee O'Neill said he was happy to see all the financial credits coming back, so we can move forward with other projects.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson,
Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: none

Absent: Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

Abstain: none

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved as presented

Motion: Motion made by Student Trustee Campbell, seconded by Trustee O'Neill to approve Consent Agenda Item Student Services/Student Learning Item 1, Approval of Curriculum Modifications for Fall 2015.

Discussion – Student Trustee Campbell asked if the changes will satisfy the lab requirements and how it will affect the availability of the labs the students will need to graduate. Student Trustee Campbell stated her concern that the change falls under math and sciences and if the change will add the math unit requirements. Anna Davies, EVP Student Services/Student Learning, stated that the unit value will stay the same, but there are three units of lecture credit. They have the lab component and it is a general lecture class only. Ms. Davies confirmed concerns that lab sciences are difficult for students to get and they are working on correcting the issue. She will get back with more information once she has researched the issue. Changes will take effect next year, and she will provide follow-up once she determines the rationale behind this request. Student Trustee Campbell asked if there will be a NR059L in the catalog. Anna Davies will follow-up on this and send information to Dr. Kinnamon.

Vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson,
Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: none

Absent: Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

Abstain: none

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved as presented.

B. Human Resources

1. Resolution 112014-1 – Authorizing Application to the Director of Industrial Relations, State of California for a Certificate of Consent to Self Insure Workers' Compensation Liabilities

Motion: Motion by Trustee Stefan, seconded by Trustee O'Neill to approve authorizing the application to the Director of Industrial Relations, State of California for a Certificate of Consent to Self Insure Workers' Compensation Liabilities.

Discussion – Diane Wirth, Acting Executive Director of Human Resources, addressed this issue, reporting that documentation was originally completed, but as auditors came to organization and requested this documentation, it could not be located. The Board is asked to approve this application for the auditors, which Ms. Wirth reported was for the regular audit.

Roll Call Vote – Dr. Kinnamon conducted the roll call vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson,
Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: none

Absent: Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

Abstain: none

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

1. Resolution 112014-2 - Budget Revisions, Adjustments and Transfers

Motion: Motion by Trustee Stefan, seconded by Trustee Campbell to approve the budget revisions, adjustments and transfers.

Discussion – Lisa Howell, VP Administrative Services, reported that this resolution will assist the college in having a more fluid budget, and that changes in budget do not occur on a regular basis. Ms. Howell reported the resolution is accepted and utilized in Riverside County, and allows the District to process its budget revisions on a regular basis, and allows for monthly reporting every time there is a budget revision, or changes in income and expenditures. Ms. Howell stated that any changes coming forward that create a change in fund balance would be brought to the Board's attention.

Roll Call Vote – Dr. Kinnamon conducted the roll call vote:

Yes: Becky Broughton, Michael O'Neill, Bonnie Stefan, Aurora Wilson,
Student Trustee Eleanor Campbell

No: none

Absent: Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton

Abstain: none

Motion carried unanimously. The item stands approved.

XIII. STUDY SESSION: ENROLLMENT GROWTH UPDATE – Anna Davies,
EVP Student Success/Student Learning

Anna Davies stated that the total FTES base has increased, and COD is pursuing additional growth this year, with goals of addressing the bottlenecks, achieving center status in Indio, and positioning COD for additional growth in AY 2015.

Highlights:

- Winter intercession scheduled with 62 sections; 26 in Palm Desert (day), 6 in Palm Desert (evening), 16 in Indio, 13 online, 1 hybrid.
- 12 full-time temporary faculty, approximately 40 additional sections and more than 2000 additional seats available in the Spring and Fall of 2015 (math, English, speech, history, political science)
- Planning robust and comprehensive summer schedule with additional sections for full-time temporary faculty for Fall 2015. A task force has been developed and met yesterday to form an enrollment management committee charter. They have begun to discuss the role of the committee and how the committee can assist with short- and long-term planning for FTES by location, day/evening program ratios and begin to plan for facility development in East and West valleys. This committee will meet again in December. Student Trustee Campbell asked if students were able to join the task force, and Ms. Davies said they would. Ms. Davies also stated that this committee is a subcommittee of College Council, and there is an opportunity for students to participate there as well.

Trustee Broughton referenced a presentation that Trustee O'Neill viewed previously regarding disciplines that generate FTES. Trustee O'Neill stated that in that presentation he learned that certain disciplines generate FTES that supplement other disciplines that do not generate as many FTES, which allows COD to operate programs that COD might not be able to if they had to depend on the FTES generated by the lower-generating program. Trustee O'Neill asked if this issue is still happening, to which Ms. Davies explained that it is. Trustee O'Neill stated that the Board used to get a report that showed comparisons of how many FTES each department was generating and which departments may be supplementing other departments that did not generate as many FTES, and asked if the Board could receive that report again. Ms. Davies stated that she will work with Dr. Kinnamon on how this report could be prepared and shared with the Board by January.

XIV. CLOSED SESSION (Cont'd) – 2:23 pm

XV. OPEN SESSION

Closed Session Report: Trustee Broughton stated there was no reportable action taken in closed session.

XVI. ADJOURN – 4:13 pm

There were no objections to adjourning the meeting. Meeting adjourned at 4:13.


By: Mary Jane Sanchez-Fulton, Clerk