Evaluation Team Report
For

College of the Desert
43-500 Monterey Avenue
Palm Desert, CA 92260

This report represents the findings of the evaluation team that visited
College of the Desert
October 2-5, 2017

Lori Bennett, Ed.D.
Chair

List of Team Members

Dr. Lori Bennett (Chair)
President
Clovis Community College

Ms. Shawn Abbott
Faculty, Business and Computers
College of the Siskiyous

Dr. Alan Buckley
Faculty, Professor of Political Science
Santa Monica College

Ms. Denice Inciong
District Director of Research, Planning, and
Data Management
South Orange County CCD

Dr. John Ruys
Instructor of Psychology
Las Positas College

Mr. Michael Tuitasi
Vice President of Student Affairs
Santa Monica College

Ms. Emilie Gerety (Team Assistant)
Assistant to the President
Clovis Community College

Ms. Elizabeth Bowman
Library Director
Santa Barbara City College

Dr. Michele Bresso
Vice President of Academic Affairs
Gavilan College

Ms. Robbie Kunkel
Dean of Instruction, CTE and Dual
Enrollment
Clovis Community College

Ms. Cheryl Sullivan
Vice President of Administrative Services
Fresno City College

Summary of the External Evaluation Report

INSTITUTION: College of the Desert

DATES OF VISIT: October 2 – October 5, 2017

TEAM CHAIR: Dr. Lori Bennett

An eleven-member accreditation external evaluation team visited College of the Desert (COD) on October 2-5, 2017 for the purpose of determining whether the College continues to meet Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements (ER), Commission Policies, and United States Department of Education (USDE) regulations. The team evaluated the degree to which the College is achieving its stated purposes. In addition, the team provided recommendations for quality assurance and institutional improvement, and submitted recommendations to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) regarding the accredited status of the College.

In preparation for the visit, the team chair attended Team Chair Training on August 3, 2017 and also conducted a pre-visit to College of the Desert on September 20, 2017. During this visit, the chair and team assistant met with the College leadership and key personnel involved in the preparation of the Self Study Report as well as toured the main campus of COD. In addition, the evaluation team received team training provided by ACCJC staff on September 8, 2017.

The team reviewed the Institutional Self Evaluation Report (ISER) for Reaffirmation of Accreditation and Quality Focus Essays prior to the visit. Team members provided written assessments of College of the Desert's Institutional Self Evaluation Report, reviewed the evidence, and identified areas for investigation during the campus visit. Team members found the Report to be somewhat brief in several of its description sections, but accurate in the analysis and evaluation sections. Some areas required further effort on the part of the team to corroborate the Report's assertions. On October 1, 2016, prior to the formal beginning of the visit, the team met and reviewed the issues, concerns and needs for additional evidence.

Interviews with College of the Desert faculty, staff, committees, and leaders were scheduled Monday, October 2, 2017 through the afternoon of Wednesday, October 4, 2017. During the evaluation visit, team members met with 16 various committees and constituent groups and conducted interviews with approximately 240 employees, students, and Trustees. The team conducted two open forums to listen to interested stakeholders with approximately 85 total in attendance. Members of the evaluation team met with members of the Desert Community College District Board of Trustees and the district senior leadership team. As the visit progressed, the entire team noted College of the Desert's commitment to students and the community.

On the afternoon of Monday, October 2, 2017, two team members visited the Indio and Mecca/Thermal campuses of College of the Desert and participated in a guided tour of the campus. On the morning of Tuesday, October 3, 2017, two team members visited the Desert Hot

Spring campus for a tour of the facilities. Team members also received a tour of the main campus. Some individuals visited specific facilities related to their assigned standards.

The team reviewed numerous materials supporting the Institutional Self-Evaluation Report, including documents and evidence supporting the standards, eligibility requirements, commission policies, and USDE regulations. Evidence reviewed by the team included, but was not limited to, institutional plans, Board of Trustees agendas and minutes, program review procedures and reports, enrollment information, committee minutes and materials, and college governance structures. Evidence was reviewed in hard-copy in the team room and electronically via flash drives, on internal college systems, and on the college's public website.

College of the Desert was organized and prepared for the visit with key leaders and staff members ready to assist the team with any needs that arose. The team was extremely complimentary of the enthusiasm of the College faculty, staff, and students throughout the team visit. The manner in which College of the Desert employees responded to team requests for additional interviews, pieces of evidence, or materials to support the team room was very professional and accommodating. The College responded in a timely manner to all requests made by the evaluation team.

The team found the College to be in compliance with the Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies, and USDE Regulations. The team found many effective practices and programs and identified a number of commendations to the College. The team found the College meets all the Standards, but issued some recommendations to increase effectiveness.

Introduction

The Desert Community College District covers nearly 4,000 square miles. The main campus, College of the Desert, is based in Palm Desert, California, near the center of the vibrant Coachella Valley with additional locations in Indio, Mecca/Thermal, and Desert Hot Springs.

Coachella Valley voters approved the formation of a community college district in 1958. Three years of study and planning led to the construction of nine buildings on 160 acres in Palm Desert. In 2004, local voters approved a $346.5 million bond measure to renovate campus facilities and expand to serve future needs. Over the following decade, ten new buildings were constructed at the Palm Desert campus.

In 2009, the college opened its Mecca/Thermal location. In 2014, the Indio location opened a 40,000-square-foot building in a city where classes had been held in temporary locations since 1988. The campus serves about 4,000 students a year. In fall 2016, the college added a western valley campus in Desert Hot Springs at the Edward L. Wenzlaff Education Center. Classes are also offered at Cathedral City, Desert Hot Springs, Palm Springs and Rancho Mirage high schools. The college provides strong support for all of its educational sites and is responsive to the needs of the communities in which they serve.

In May 2016, more than 1,100 College of the Desert students graduated with associate's degrees and/or certificates of achievement. As of 2017, the college enrolled more than 15,000 students. It is one of the fastest-growing community colleges in California with enrollment up 30 percent since 2012. About 84 percent of students are the first in their family to attend college. The college generates the local workforce with 75 percent of graduates staying or returning to live and work in the community. College operations have a $302 million impact on the local economy each year, and alumni contribute more than $243 million annually to the local economy. Over the years, more than 120,000 alumni have graduated from College of the Desert.

The college has demonstrated intentional growth that aligns with the area it serves, developing innovative programs and services along the way. College faculty and staff work across disciplines in order to provide the best educational experience possible to students. As an example, Agriculture students maintain farm and garden areas that serve as outdoor learning areas for children attending the Child Development Lab School. Students in the Culinary Arts program prepare meals with the produce grown creating a literal "farm to fork" nutritional learning experience for all involved.

The college has made significant educational and fiscal improvements over the last five years. The community has acknowledged and embraced these changes, and College of the Desert has become an important, active community partner. The College focuses on its mission and vision to provide quality educational offerings and boost the economic vitality of the Coachella Valley.

Major Findings and Recommendations

Team Commendations

During the visit, the team recognized several aspects of the College worthy of commendations.

College Commendation 1

The team commends the College for enthusiastically embracing its mission and vision, as evidenced by its ongoing innovative, collaborative and community focused activities at all levels of the organization.

College Commendation 2

The team commends the College for its planning and decision-making processes, which are clearly defined and support collaborative, consensus building decision-making, recognizing in particular the College Planning Council.

College Commendation 3

The team commends the College for its high quality and effective use of technology in its distance education offerings, especially in development of the online shell review and continual professional development requirements to ensure current, quality online instruction.

College Commendation 4

The team commends the College for its clear and committed student-centered focus as evidenced by the visibility and accessibility of the Craven Student Center, the plEDGE Program, numerous student support counseling programs, and a responsiveness to student needs for student and learning support services provided at satellite locations.

College Commendation 5

The team commends the College for its vision and strong community commitment. Guided by college leadership, the college and community have embraced each other in a deep and mutually supportive manner that enhances the vitality of the Coachella Valley.

Team Recommendations

As a result of the external evaluation, the team makes the following recommendations.

Recommendations for Improvement

College Recommendation 1 (Improvement)

In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the implementation of the recently improved Program Review process to ensure institutional mission, goals, and planning priorities are linked to resource allocation. (I.A.2, III.D.2)

College Recommendation 2 (Improvement)

In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College ensure a broader understanding among college constituents of institutional metrics and how they measure progress in accomplishing the college's mission and strategic goals. (I.B.1, I.B.3, I.B.4, I.B.5)

College Recommendation 3 (Improvement)
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the revisions to the program student learning outcomes for all degree and certificate programs. In addition, the College should ensure full and regular analysis and dialogue concerning course, program, and institutional student learning outcome data. (I.A.2, I.A.3, II.A.3)

College Recommendation 4 (Improvement)
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the implementation of its employee evaluation tracking process and associated training in order to ensure performance evaluations are completed in a timely manner. (III.A.5)

Eligibility Requirements

1. **Authority**

   The team confirmed that College of the Desert is authorized to operate as a post-secondary, degree-granting institution based on continuous accreditation by the Accrediting Commission of Community and Junior Colleges, a subsection of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges, a regional accreditor. In addition, the College operates under the authority of the State of California Educational Code, which establishes the California community college system under the leadership and direction of the Board of Governors (State of California Education Code 70900-70901).

   The College meets the ER.

2. **Operational Status**

   The team confirmed the institution is operational and students are actively pursuing degree programs at the college. The College provides educational services to 15,791 unduplicated annual students within degree-applicable credit courses for the period 2016-2017.

   The College meets the ER.

3. **Degrees**

   The team confirmed that 96 percent of courses lead to a degree and/or transfer. Sixty percent of students identify transfer, degree or certificate completion as their primary objective.

   The College meets the ER.

4. **Chief Executive Officer**

   The team confirmed that the Board of Trustees employs a superintendent/president as the chief executive officer (CEO) of the College of the Desert Community College District whose full-time responsibility is to the institution. The Superintendent/ President was appointed by the Board of Trustees in July 2012. The CEO possesses the requisite authority to administer board policies and does not serve as a member of the Board of Trustees or as board president.

   The College meets the ER.

5. **Financial Accountability**
   The team confirmed that College of the Desert engages a qualified audit firm to conduct audits of all financial records of the College including the General Fund, the College Foundation, and the Government Obligation (GO) bond funds. All audits are certified and all explanations or findings are documented appropriately. Audit reports are made publicly available. The team further confirmed that the College meets all Title IV

eligibility requirements achieving a three-year average default rate for 2014 of 24 percent before discontinuing direct loans which was below the 30 percent federal requirement.

The College meets the ER.

Compliance with Commission Policies and Federal Regulations

Public Notification of an Evaluation Team Visit and Third Party Comment
Evaluation Items:

☒	The institution has made an appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comment in advance of a comprehensive evaluation visit.
☒	The institution cooperates with the evaluation team in any necessary follow-up related to the third party comment.
☒	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions* as to third party comment.

Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions as to third party comment.
[Regulation citation: 602.23(b).]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

College of the Desert is committed to complying with accreditation requirements standards, and policies. The institution has solicited third-party comment through the accreditation home page on the college website. In addition, the website postings related to accreditation status and the evaluation team visit provide links to all related documents in the interest of full public disclosure.

Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement
Evaluation Items:

☒	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance across the institution, and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. Course completion is included as one of these elements of student achievement. Other elements of student achievement performance for measurement have been determined as appropriate to the institution's mission.

☒	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance within each instructional program, and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. The defined elements include, but are not limited to, job placement rates for program completers, and for programs in fields where licensure is required, the licensure examination passage rates for program completers.
☒	The institution-set standards for programs and across the institution are relevant to guide self-evaluation and institutional improvement; the defined elements and expected performance levels are appropriate within higher education; the results are reported regularly across the campus; and the definition of elements and results are used in program-level and institution-wide planning to evaluate how well the institution fulfills its mission, to determine needed changes, to allocating resources, and to make improvements.
☒	The institution analyzes its performance as to the institution-set standards and as to student achievement, and takes appropriate measures in areas where its performance is not at the expected level.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(i); 602.17(f); 602.19 (a-e).]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

College of the Desert has established and assesses the degree to which it is achieving its institution-set standards for student achievement as well as for additional standards appropriate to the mission.

Credits, Program Length, and Tuition
Evaluation Items:

☒	Credit hour assignments and degree program lengths are within the range of good practice in higher education (in policy and procedure).
☒	The assignment of credit hours and degree program lengths is verified by the institution, and is reliable and accurate across classroom based courses, laboratory classes, distance education classes, and for courses that involve clinical practice (if applicable to the institution).
☒	Tuition is consistent across degree programs (or there is a rational basis for any program-specific tuition).

	Any clock hour conversions to credit hours adhere to the Department of Education's conversion formula, both in policy and procedure, and in practice.
☒	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits*.

[Regulation citations: 600.2 (definition of credit hour); 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.24(e), (f); 668.2; 668.9.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

College of the Desert does not award credit based on clock hour conversions. Tuition is consistent across degrees and the fee structure is clearly published in the Schedule of Classes.

COD determines the number of units or credits through a formula that meets federal and California guidelines. COD validates the integrity of its course, degree and certificate offerings through Curriculum Committee review at the local level and approval at the California Community College's Chancellor's office. Board Policies are in place to support this.

Transfer Policies
Evaluation Items:

☒	Transfer policies are appropriately disclosed to students and to the public.
☒	Policies contain information about the criteria the institution uses to accept credits for transfer.
☒	The institution complies with the Commission *Policy on Transfer of Credit*.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.17(a)(3); 602.24(e); 668.43(a)(ii).]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not

	meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

College of the Desert's transfer policies are clearly communicated to students through the Catalog. In the 2017-2018 Catalog, pages 16-20 and 50-51 describe policies in compliance with commission policies.

Distance Education and Correspondence Education

Evaluation Items:

☒	The institution has policies and procedures for defining and classifying a course as offered by distance education or correspondence education, in alignment with USDE definitions.
☒	There is an accurate and consistent application of the policies and procedures for determining if a course is offered by distance education (with regular and substantive interaction with the instructor, initiated by the instructor, and online activities are included as part of a student's grade) or correspondence education (online activities are primarily "paperwork related," including reading posted materials, posting homework and completing examinations, and interaction with the instructor is initiated by the student as needed).
☒	The institution has appropriate means and consistently applies those means for verifying the identity of a student who participates in a distance education or correspondence education course or program, and for ensuring that student information is protected.
☒	The technology infrastructure is sufficient to maintain and sustain the distance education and correspondence education offerings.
☒	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education*.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(iv), (vi); 602.17(g); 668.38.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

Desert Community College District Administrative Procedure (AP) 4105 Distance Education (DE) gives procedures for defining and classifying a course offered by distance education. AP

4105 gives four course categories for courses offered through distance education (Fully Online Course, Proctored Online Course, Hybrid Course, and Web Enhanced Course), processes for shell review, and faculty training requirements. COD does not offer courses through correspondence education. AP 4105 also describes the Regular Effective Contact Policy which covers instructor initiated contact, frequency and duration of contact, and establishes expectations for contact during unexpected absences. The COD has a strong system for reviewing all course shells to match with the Online Education Initiative (OEI) rubric for best practices in distance education. The DE subcommittee approves all course shells prior to them being offered as an online course. There are clear standards that DE courses are held to in order to maintain a high level of quality.

Student Complaints

Evaluation Items:

☒	The institution has clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, and the current policies and procedures are accessible to students in the college catalog and online.
☒	The student complaint files for the previous six years (since the last comprehensive evaluation) are available; the files demonstrate accurate implementation of the complaint policies and procedures.
☒	The team analysis of the student complaint files identifies any issues that may be indicative of the institution's noncompliance with any Accreditation Standards.
☒	The institution posts on its website the names of associations, agencies and govern mental bodies that accredit, approve, or license the institution and any of its programs, and provides contact information for filing complaints with such entities.
☒	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Representation of Accredited Status* and the *Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions*.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(ix); 668.43.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

The College of the Desert 2017-2018 Catalog clearly describes "Student Grievance Policy & Procedures" on page 37. In addition, the COD website includes a page entitled "Complaints & Grievances" outlining the process for students. The student complaint file for the previous six years was provided. Given that COD attempts to resolve grievances on an informal basis, very few formal complaints are documented. A

summary of issues which are resolved on an informal basis might serve helpful in analyzing the nature of student issues.

Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials
Evaluation Items:

☒	The institution provides accurate, timely (current), and appropriately detailed information to students and the public about its programs, locations, and policies.
☒	The institution complies with the Commission *Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Representation of Accredited Status*.
☒	The institution provides required information concerning its accredited status as described above in the section on Student Complaints.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1))(vii); 668.6.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

College of the Desert is in compliance with ACCJC's Policy on Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials. Information about programs, locations, and policies is communicated to students and the public via the college catalog, schedule of classes, and website. The catalog and website provide the status of accreditation. The college does not represent program costs, job placement, employment opportunities, and offer money in exchange for enrollment or guarantee employment in order to recruit students.

Title IV Compliance
Evaluation Items:

☒	The institution has presented evidence on the required components of the Title IV Program, including findings from any audits and program or other review activities by the USDE.
☒	The institution has addressed any issues raised by the USDE as to financial responsibility requirements, program record-keeping, etc. If issues were not timely addressed, the institution demonstrates it has the fiscal and administrative capacity to timely address issues in the future and to retain compliance with Title IV program requirements.

☒	The institution's student loan default rates are within the acceptable range defined by the USDE. Remedial efforts have been undertaken when default rates near or meet a level outside the acceptable range.
☒	Contractual relationships of the institution to offer or receive educational, library, and support services meet the Accreditation Standards and have been approved by the Commission through substantive change if required.
☒	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission *Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations* and the *Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV*.

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(v); 602.16(a)(1)(x); 602.19(b); 668.5; 668.15; 668.16; 668.71 et seq.]

Conclusion Check-Off:

☒	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
☐	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

College of the Desert engages a qualified audit firm to conduct audits of all financial records of the College including the General Fund, the College Foundation, and the Government Obligation (GO) bond funds. All audits are certified and all explanations or findings are documented appropriately. Audit reports are made publicly available. The team further confirmed that College meets all Title IV eligibility requirements achieving a three year average default rate for 2014 of 24 percent before discontinuing direct loans which was below the 30 percent federal requirement.

Standard I
Institutional Mission and Effectiveness

Standard I.A Mission

General Observations
The College of the Desert (COD) mission demonstrates a strong commitment to serving its community and clearly articulates the college's offerings. The mission was recently revised to more closely align with the revised ACCJC standards and was thoroughly reviewed by the college community. The mission is widely published in the college catalog, website, planning documents, and prominently posted throughout the campus. With the recently revised processes and plans, the College is well poised to continue to align all of their planning and resource allocation to their new strategic goals that fulfill their mission.

Findings and Evidence
A review of the mission statement confirmed the college has a process to review and update the mission statement to ensure it reflects the population served and accurately represents the educational offerings. (I.A., ER 6)

The Strategic Master Plan 2016-2021 and newly updated Educational Master Plan (EMP) 2017-2022 include the mission as the overarching driver for the College's strategic and educational goals. The college has a strong structure and re-invigorated processes at the department and unit levels that ensure data assessment is part of institutional planning. Interviews with the Educational Master Plan Task Force confirm that the process for developing the current plan was collaborative and inclusive, and will be used to further clarify and drive the direction of the college. The team heard strong sentiments of approval regarding the process the college followed to develop the Educational Master Plan was worked on across the college community. The next phase of the EMP is to develop action plans that include metrics to assess each objective under the six major educational goals and assign responsibilities and timelines to accomplish each objective. (I.A.2)

The College Planning Council (CPC) Handbook clearly articulates the College's planning processes and the college has a well-defined structure that supports the mission. In order to better align the College's processes to the mission, the college has begun to update existing templates and forms to include the College mission. Examples of processes that directly tie to the mission are Program Reviews Updates for student services and the Staff Hiring Prioritization. The College's Outcomes and Assessment Committee (OAC) exhibited a strong commitment to improving the program review process for academic programs. The OAC committee also showed a strong commitment to improve their Program Review process, which was revamped and recently renamed to Program Enhancement Plan (PEP) and the annual program update process was renamed to PEP-Up. The new program review process was adopted by the OAC Committee on May 4, 2017. The new program review template specifically asks programs and service areas to evaluate their alignment with the mission. The prioritization process utilizes the program review reports for resource allocation. (I.A.3)

Major planning committees at the college reviewed and approved an updated mission. The College Planning Council, Assessment of Planning and Outcomes Subcommittee (APO) and the Board of Trustees evaluate the mission and its relationship to the institution's priorities and educational needs. A review and update of the mission will occur every three years. The mission is widely published in the various locations including the catalog, college website, and College Planning Council Handbook. (I.A.4, ER 6)

Conclusions
The commitment and dedication to the community the college demonstrates is evident, honorable, and significant. Initiatives such as the plEDGE program serving local high school graduates, the multiple collaborative and supportive partnerships with local agencies, and the vital industry connections are making a positive impact on student access and success.

The College meets Standard I.A and ER 6.

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement

College Recommendation 1
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the implementation of the recently improved Program Review process to ensure institutional mission, goals, and planning priorities are linked to resource allocation. (I.A.2, III.D.2)

College Recommendation 3
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the revisions to the program student learning outcomes for all degree and certificate programs. In addition, the College should ensure full and regular analysis and dialogue concerning course, program, and institutional student learning outcome data. (I.A.2, I.A.3, II.A.3)

Standard I.B   Institutional Effectiveness

General Observations
College of the Desert (COD) has a supportive and collaborative environment that encourages robust dialogue on improving student learning and achievement. COD demonstrates a commitment to promoting a "culture of assessment" and continual improvement among stakeholders. COD has data reports that are easy to understand and readily available on the Office of Institutional Research's website. Dialogue regarding outcomes assessment appears in minutes across all campus committees. Campus stakeholders complimented the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Research for making data and reports accessible and easy to understand.
Additionally, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Research coordinates and supports the college in continual evaluation and improvement in planning and outcomes assessment.

Through review of evidence and interviews, the team confirmed that the process for evaluation of student learning is becoming more deliberate and better planned at College of the Desert. The College recognizes that course level outcomes have been more successful in the cycle of assessment. However, the College has recently determined that their definition of "program" was ineffective and inaccurate, and has a plan to revise all Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs). The Academic Senate Outcomes and Assessment Committee is focusing on the completion of PLOs and Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs). The faculty's commitment to this work was evident in a resolution passed by the senate. The college also addresses this gap in their Quality Focus Essay.

Institution Set Standards are discussed in conjunction with the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office Institutional Effectiveness Goals. The college has reviewed and published goals for course completion, remedial math pass rates, CTE job placement rates, and degree, certificate and transfer Rates. COD uses data from the Community College Student Survey of Engagement (CCSSE) to measure ILOs. COD utilizes quantitative data as well as qualitative data in their assessments. For qualitative analysis the college utilizes survey instruments in a multitude of areas, such as exploring student course demand and scheduling preferences, graduate follow-up surveys, college committee self-assessments, evaluation of processes such as the faculty hiring prioritization, and other satisfaction surveys.

Ongoing, collegial, and self-reflective dialogue about continuous improvement of student learning and institutional processes takes place within the College's planning processes and through cross-committee dialogue during joint meetings. The college has also completed their Educational Master Plan (EMP) 2017-2022 and has aligned the education goals and objectives to the five major strategic goals. Team interviews with the APO confirmed that plans are underway to develop action plans for the objectives where they will define responsibility and metrics for assessment. A comprehensive five-year planning calendar is developed to synchronize with all of the major planning initiatives (Strategic Plan, Educational Master Plan, Program Reviews, Technology Plan, Facilities Plan, Accreditation, etc.) as well as an annual planning calendar for instructional processes, staff and faculty prioritizations, and resource requests.

Findings and Evidence
The college demonstrates collegial and meaningful dialog about academic quality and student achievement. Data and reports on the college's Institutional Research website are readily available and easy to use. The End-User Data Group expressed great satisfaction with the information warehouse and fact book maintained on the Institutional Research webpage. College faculty expressed that everyone has access to data and the reports are easy to use and understand. The members of the group expressed that these reports have allowed the programs to engage in dialogue with their department regarding the evaluation of academic programs and also disaggregate student achievement data and explore possible solutions to increasing success. The college provided information on the number of course, program and institutional outcomes that have been established. The college has defined Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) for all instructional programs and student and learning support services. However, they are not all being assessed on a regular basis. The most recent SLO annual report made available (2014) shows that 67 percent of the courses are being regularly assessed, 100 percent of the programs are being

regularly assessed, and 100 percent of student support services are being regularly assessed (I.B.1)

During the site visit, the team confirmed that the college's assessment of their student learning outcomes for instructional programs was lacking. The college has a plan to address these inefficiencies or gaps and the team confirmed that this work is occurring. The college has assigned two 40 percent release time SLO Coordinators to support the OAC in working with the programs to accomplish Quality Focus Essay (QFE) Project 1. In addition, the revision of the program review process will include an alignment to the college mission and revision of the program learning outcomes (PLOs). (I.B.2, ER 11)

The College Planning Council Handbook provided evidence that there are solid processes and structures to dialogue about institutional effectiveness and educational quality for the improvement of student learning and achievement. In CPC, APO, and OAC minutes it is evident that student learning and achievement are regularly being discussed. In these meetings, members were able to identify gaps in the learning outcomes and start to address these with a plan for OAC. Recommendations to have support for OAC to improve the assessment of learning outcomes were important for the academic senate and administrative leadership to discuss and prioritize. These discussions were of such high priority the Academic Senate passed a resolution in March of 2017 that made a commitment to assessing all outcomes college-wide. (I.B.2, ER 11)

The Enrollment Management Committee (EMC) also expressed a multitude of strategies they have explored due to use of data analysis, some of the examples provided were adjustment of the summer start data for classes to better align with the high schools; and more concurrent and graduating high school students enrolled in summer courses. Additionally, members spoke to adjustments in registration dates that supported retaining students who were being lost because they were not meeting fee waiver deadlines and if they were better able to secure financial support they were more likely to be retained to the next semester. Initiatives like mapping courses and offerings to specific paths have helped students stay on track. Additionally, the counseling office is supporting instructional departments. Counselors work with departments that are defining these program paths and serve as liaisons between the student and department. The Enrollment Management Committee members expressed that they are utilizing the new Education Master Plan. (I.B.2, ER 11)

The college published their Institutional Set-Standards (ISS) on the Institutional Research website. The college set ISS for completion using state MIS data for course completion, and Student Success Scorecard data for degree and certificate completion and transfer rate. The college used the California Perkins Job Placement Rate for their CTE program ISS. The End User Data Subcommittee reviewed the data and reviewed the methodology used to set the ISS. The EMC, OAC, and APO shared and reviewed the data for the ISS. From these discussions, the recommendations for setting the ISS were forwarded to CPC for final approval and adoption. The College is continuing to review the ISS as the College shared with the team that they have achieved the progress rate for remedial math and are currently in discussions to review where the standard should be set for the upcoming year. (I.B.3, ER 11)

The college's Enrollment Management Committee is a robust group that is ensuring instructional processes support student learning and student achievement. The committee is led by the Vice Presidents of Student Success and Student Learning and the Academic Senate President. The membership is inclusive and the members are able to analyze data and respond in a timely manner to make actionable change for better student outcomes and program improvements. The interviews provided valuable examples of the college using data such as the "Sandbox Tool" which departments can use to model their schedules to evaluate growth or reduction in offerings as well as understand the impact to full-time equivalent students or productivity metrics. Members expressed utilizing a variety of data to support student demand for classes. One member provided an example of meeting student course needs. The department utilized "crasher" data (lists of students who wanted to get into classes but could not and were left on wait lists) and "new" data that provided course demand from students' educational plans. The college uses both data sets to adjust offerings in the class schedule in order to fulfill student plan needs and support student achievement. (I.B.4)

The college is revamping its academic program review process to address student learning and achievement comprehensively. The OAC recommended changes to Academic Senate, which were approved to improve the program review process and rename it to Program Enhancement Process (PEP) and also their annual program update process was renamed to PEP-Up. Student services have updated and are utilizing their program review reports. The college has piloted disaggregation of SLO data in their Architecture and Early Childhood Education programs. Early Childhood Education was able to use disaggregated data and identified strategies to support the success of students whose first language is not English and identified ways to help these students be successful in the program. (I.B.5, I.B.6)

The college has made a concerted effort to improve the effectiveness of their governance processes that support academic quality and to evaluate its policies and practices. One of the successful examples is the confirmation of the College Planning Council. It was conveyed to the team that five years ago CPC was about to be dissolved and the President reviewed its purpose and felt that it should be utilized as a place for all voices around campus to be heard. It is evident from minutes and speaking with various groups that this council is an effective place for dialog and collaboration amongst all constituency groups across the campus. Another example of processes that support student learning and achievement was the creation of a new faculty hiring prioritization which utilized a rubric to weight the position requested. As evidenced in the college's self-evaluation and in interviews, this new process was successful in coming to an open and collaborative process that engages all parties in the decisions that affect student learning. The college's commitment to institutional effectiveness, planning and using data to improve can also be seen in the 2013 creation of the Department of Institutional Effectiveness, Education Services, and Planning and providing support to the Institutional Research Office. The college also established a Chairs Council to evaluate gaps in their committees and create better alignment and reduce redundancy. (I.B.7)

As illustrated in the CPC Handbook, committee minutes and interviews, the college's committee structure enforces dialog and communication of major metrics and it was evident decisions are occurring throughout the college to support student learning and achievement. (I.B.8)

The team probed to understand how much of the evaluation is connected to major strategic goals and the mission and, although robust dialog, analysis, and accomplishments are occurring, it was difficult to connect and align these activities to the major goals of the college. The team recognized the solid work in planning that is happening and being built at the time of the visit. Based on evidence and interviews, the team felt, once the processes were implemented and had time to mature and complete a full evaluation cycle, the college would better see how they are accomplishing their major strategic and educational goals. The team expects the college will also be able to better articulate how their work is aligned to goals, which are measured and linked to resource allocation, that fulfill its mission. (I.B.9, ER 19)

Conclusions
The college meets Standard I.B, ER 11, and ER 19

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement

College Recommendation 2
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College ensure a broader understanding among college constituents of institutional metrics and how they measure progress in accomplishing the college's mission and strategic goals. (I.B.1, I.B.3, I.B.4, I.B.5) Per I.B.2, above, the team has noted that ILO assessment is lacking. You may want to encourage continued progress on that issue here as well.

Standard I.C Institutional Integrity

General Observations
The College of the Desert demonstrates integrity by providing accurate information about its mission, educational programs, and student support services online and in print for students and the community. The college gives accurate information for current and prospective students of the total cost of education, including tuition, fees, and other required expenses, including textbooks, and other instructional material.

The Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Research Office presents numerous student achievement data reports for the College community and the public. Achievement and learning outcomes data are included in program review, which impacts program and budget planning. Review processes exist for institutional policies and procedures.

Findings and Evidence

The College of the Desert communicates accurate information about its mission, educational programs, learning outcomes, and student support services online and in print for students, personnel, and the community. The team confirmed that the college has a dedicated link containing accurate information regarding its ACCJC accreditation status on the front page of the college website. (I.C.1, ER 20)

The college provides a print or online catalog for students and prospective students with precise, accurate, and current information on the required elements listed in the "Catalog Requirements." Information on student tuition, fees, and other financial obligations are found on pages 21-22 of the 2016-17 catalog. The catalog can be easily downloaded as a pdf from the college website. A team from student success (student services) and student learning (instruction) reviews the catalog annually. Faculty, staff, and administrative input is gathered prior to the publication of the catalog. Earlier versions of the catalog are available online to 2000-2001. (I.C.2, ER 20).

The Institutional Research and the Institutional Effectiveness Planning websites contain easily accessible student data on learning and achievement in the college fact book and posting of the state Scorecard and Institutional Effectiveness goals. Course student learning outcomes are published on the Course Outlines of Record (COR) and on all syllabi that the team examined. Student achievement data and SLO assessment data is contained and discussed in Program Review Updates (PRU) produced on an annual basis and on comprehensive Academic Program Review (APR). Program and institutional learning outcomes are published in the catalog. Four areas (GE Program Outcomes, Basic Skills Program Outcomes, CTE Program Outcomes, and Student Support Services Outcomes) tie to program outcomes. The team confirmed through interviews that the college sent a group of faculty members to training on assessment practices that resulted in the Outcomes and Assessment Committee (OAC) redefining programs and program outcomes. The college is in the process of writing new program learning outcomes for all degrees and certificates. The revised outcomes will be used to inform program review, which specifically asks faculty to examine program level SLO data. (I.C.3, ER 19)

The College catalog and the website describe the degrees and certificates in terms of their purpose, content, and course requirements (I.C.4).

The College has Board Policies (BP), Administrative Procedures (AP), and publications (for example, College Catalog and Faculty Handbook) that assure institutional integrity of its programs and services. The team confirmed that policies, procedures, and publications are regularly reviewed and revised, as necessary. Any changes to BPs and APs are approved by the Board of Trustees. (I.C.5)

The College Catalog, the college website, and the college bookstore accurately inform current and prospective students of the total costs of education, including fees and the costs of instructional materials and textbooks. (I.C.6)

The COD publishes governing board policies on academic freedom and responsibility. BP and AP 4030 describe the policies and procedures that guide the protection of academic freedom and the pursuit and dissemination of knowledge. In addition, the Academic Freedom Statement is on page 254 of the 2016-17 catalog. (I.C.7, ER 13).

Board policies 3050 (Code of Ethics), 4030 (Academic Freedom), and 5500 (Standards of Students Conduct) and administrative procedures 2710, 2712, 2715, 3050, 3711, 3712, 4030, 5500, 5520, 5530 all directly promote honesty, responsibility, and academic integrity. These policies apply to all constituent groups. BP/AP 3050 and 4030 address the importance of faculty (and all employees) distinguishing between personal conviction and professionally accepted views in the discipline. The college does not seek to instill specific beliefs or worldviews and does not operate in foreign locations; therefore the standards are not applicable to COD. (I.C.8, I.C.9, I.C.10)

College of the Desert does not operate in foreign locations. (I.C.11)

The college has a dedicated link containing information on its ACCJC accreditation status on the front page of the college website and available to students, staff, faculty, and the community. In addition, information on the status of the McCarthy Family Child Development & Training Center and the Vocational Nursing program is on the college website. The Registered Nursing program (ADN) is approved by the California State Board of Nursing through May 13, 2019. BP/AP 3200 directly addresses the role of the superintendent/president in complying with accreditation requirements. The college has responded to requests for information from ACCJC and discloses information required by the Commission. (I.C.12, I.C.13, ER 21)

The college does not have external interests, investors, or a parent organization to consider. This allows it to focus on high quality education, student achievement, and student learning. (I.C.14)

Conclusions
The College meets Standard I.C and ER 13, 19, 20 and 21.

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement
None

Standard II
Student Learning Programs and Services

Standard II. A Instructional Programs

General Observations
College of the Desert offers a range of instructional programs leading to degrees and certificates in support of transfer, workforce development, lifelong learning and basic skills improvement. Programs are relevant to the service area of the college including specialized programming serving targeted communities in Palm Desert, Palm Springs, Desert Hot Springs, Indio and Thermal/Mecca.

College of the Desert offers 132 degrees and certificates including 13 associate of arts degrees, 30 associate of science degrees, 26 associate degrees for transfer, 57 certificates of achievement, and 6 certificates of performance. These programs align with the college's mission. All degree programs contain at least one area of inquiry, with the courses in these areas reflective of the appropriate level of mastery and based upon student learning outcomes.

The college presents student achievement of degrees and certificates as being a synthesis of attainment, not only of knowledge but also of life experience, growth of capabilities and more. This holistic view elevates the college's work to that of enlightenment of a community. The collaboration between service units, along with community and industry partnerships, evidences thoughtful co-creation of programming to benefit students.

Process improvement and responsiveness to student needs are themes throughout evidence and in interviews with committee members. Processes related to program review and assessment of SLOs evidenced updates and enhancements of forms and processes. . New and developing processes will ensure continual improvement.

Findings and Evidence
College of the Desert offers programs consistent with its mission, regardless of location or means of delivery. The College has processes to ensure that all course and program offerings align with the mission. Board Policy 4020 (Program and Curriculum Development) articulates the role of faculty and students in planning and development of degrees and curriculum. Examination of Curriculum Committee minutes, review of curriculum processes, and interviews with faculty and others engaged in the curriculum creation and approval revealed that instructional programs are appropriate to higher education and culminate in student attainment of identified student learning outcomes as well as achievement of degrees, certificates, employment or transfer to other higher education programs. The levels of quality and rigor conducted in programs are appropriate to the degrees offered. (II.A.1, ER 9, ER 11)

The team confirmed that the College ensures content and methods of instruction meet generally accepted academic and professional standards and expectations. Minutes of the Curriculum Committee, under the auspices of the Academic Senate, detail discussions to ensure that programs and courses meet standards. New programs approved by the Curriculum Committee address major areas of emphasis, links to existing programs, the need to review degrees for

accuracy, and transfer preparation. Faculty engage in systematic evaluation of programs through the program review process that addresses environmental trends, program currency, and student success data in relation to courses and programs as well as projecting staffing requirements and technology to enhance instruction. Professional development, such as the workshop on Culturally Responsive Teaching and Learning, supports the teaching and learning strategies of all faculty. The College has a robust system for reviewing course shells to match with the Online Education Initiative rubric for best practices in distance education. The Distance Education Subcommittee approves all course shells prior to them being offered as an online course. There are clear standards that DE courses are held to in order to maintain a high level of quality and effective use of technology. (II.A.2)

Through a review of the college catalog, course syllabi, Program Review Updates, and interviews with department chairs and division deans, evidence demonstrated that the institution identifies learning outcomes for courses, programs, certificates, and degrees using established institutional procedures. The team reviewed program review documents and confirmed that all departments have identified program-level outcomes. The institution has officially approved and kept current course outlines that include student learning outcomes in Curricunet. A comprehensive review of the syllabus repository by the team showed evidence that students receive a course syllabus that include learning outcomes from the institution's officially approved course outline. A complete review of the PRUs from 2014-15 and 2015-16 showed that most departments are regularly analyzing course-level SLO data in some form. (II.A.3)

Examination of evidence shows that College of the Desert is documenting and improving its processes for assessment and program review. Examination of assessment reports, annual program review updates, and comprehensive program reviews demonstrated that most departments regularly assess course student learning outcomes. While all departments have identified program SLOs, the College does not have a robust system for analyzing program SLO data. As a result of examination of its definitions and processes, COD is rewriting its program SLOs and working on a better system for assessing and analyzing program SLO data. Assessment reports provided by the college illustrate a system for presenting college and assessment data with opportunities to use both in departmental planning. To engender greater understanding and participation by faculty, the Assessment of Planning and Outcomes Subcommittee has drafted the Outcomes and Assessment Handbook (OAC handbook draft), that will undergo first review this fall. The OAC handbook connects work on SLOs to the Strategic Master Plan Goals and the Educational Master Plan Goals, gives definitions and guidelines for writing and assessing SLOs, and connects assessment work more clearly to the program review process. Meanwhile, the college is creating a single-use form for all programs in order to improve the program review process. . A new version for five-year planning, called Program Enhancement Plans (PEP), will provide an avenue for explaining how PLOs align to the college mission and how assessment data are used to improve instruction. PEP-ups (annual updates of PEP) allow departments to explain how changes are occurring and their impact. These tools evidence a practice of continual improvement. (II.A.3)

College of the Desert offers pre-collegiate curriculum that directly supports students in learning the knowledge and skills necessary to advance to and succeed in college-level curriculum. Acceleration curriculum in English and English as a Second Language prepare students in core academic skills at a pace that does not penalize them with extra semesters of work. The Math Department offers a remedial mathematics curriculum. The College's recently expanded and institutionalized EDGE (Engage, Develop, Grow, and Empower) first-year experience program focuses on strengthening basic skills foundations. This program, which garnered an award from the State Chancellor's Office, encompasses student support in the form of early alerts and student development workshops to enhance learning and growth. The program has scaled up from its original 22 students to more than 2200 and it incorporates Math and English refreshers, specialized counseling, and other student services. (II.A.4)

The team confirmed that degrees and programs at College of the Desert follow practices common to American higher education. Courses are approved through the college curriculum process leading to final approval by the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office. Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADT) offered by College of the Desert attest to programs' rigor and transferability to the California State Universities. ADTs ensure that minimum degree requirements are 60 semester credits or equivalent at the associate level. General education patterns and other programs address course sequencing, breadth and depth.. For example, stackable certificates in the HVAC program provide a means of developing a broad range of professional and technical job skills through accumulation of sequenced courses and certificate achievement. The Curriculum Committee and the Outcomes and Assessment Committee review and approve clearly defined and measurable PLOs that tie to the certificates in this program. . (II.A.5; ER12)

Evidence and interviews confirmed that in the scheduling of courses, College of the Desert is mindful of student course needs, as identified in student educational plans and degree and certificate requirements. Courses listed in the catalog are offered at least once in a two-year cycle or reviewed for ongoing relevancy. Class scheduling involves input from faculty, deans, staff, counselors, administration and is informed by community or industry needs. Course scheduling is adjusted to meet the needs of students attending in the day, afternoon, and evening. Fill rates for high-demand classes are monitored closely and additional sections are added as needed. More recently, after analyzing completion data, COD made a concerted effort to ensure that students are able to complete the entirety of specific degrees at the Indio, Thermal/Mecca and Desert Hot Springs sites. After assessing the success rates in chemistry offerings, chemistry faculty changed the offering of the initial course to every semester, with additional faculty members hired, resulting in more students persisting in Organic Chemistry. In an effort to enhance student success, completion rates are tracked closely and made available to the public. (II.A.6, ER9)

Evidence confirmed that the College effectively uses delivery modes, teaching methodologies, and learning support services to support student success. Courses are provided for students in a variety of modalities (face-to-face, hybrid, online) and in different timeframes (fast track, full semester, day, night and weekend), as well as at alternate locations in the east, west and central Coachella Valley regions. The College offers courses across general education, basic skills, and career and technical education. Tutoring, library, bookstore, and other student services are added

at alternate locations, based on assessed student need. Team interviews and site visits to all campuses confirmed that the services are well-utilized and increased hours, staffing, and resources were the product of considered analysis of community needs. Interviews with faculty, administers, and committee members confirmed that through student learning outcomes assessment, academic program review, and program review updates, faculty have opportunities to discuss and adapt, when appropriate, teaching methodologies to meet students' needs. Evidence confirmed numerous examples of adjusting and improving courses to improve student success based on student learning outcomes assessment, such as providing both online and face-to-face sections, developing pathways from high schools to COD, revising course meeting schedules, and fast track scheduling of initial courses in a program to facilitate faster progression. Campus awareness of equity concerns are supported through activities and programming of the Equity Committee as well as specifically the COD SEED (Seeking Educational Equity and Diversity) committee. (II.A.7)

Department or course-wide assessments at COD are limited. Currently, only Mathematics and ESL-Noncredit assess all sections in a course. Through common rubrics, data analysis, published procedures and proctoring protocols, faculty strive to enhance the reliability and parity of results. (II.A.8)

The team evaluated documents from the Curriculum Committee, a large sample of Course Outlines of Record (COR), board policies and rules, and conducted interviews with members of the Curriculum Committee and found evidence of established awarding of course credit, degrees and certificates based on student attainment of learning outcomes. Units of credit are awarded based on generally accepted norms or equivalencies in higher education. Evidence confirmed that a recent task force of the Curriculum Committee has crafted a new Administrative Policy for credit hours and unit calculation driven by changes at the Chancellor's Office that will meet all state requirements and streamline the process for course approval. By evaluating a sample of COR, the team confirmed that the institution offers courses based on clock hour calculations. The College does not award credit based on the clock-to-credit-hour conversion formula. (II.A.9; ER 10)

Through interviews with college staff and reviews of the college catalog and the course equivalency database, the team was able to verify that College of the Desert makes available to its students clearly stated transfer-of-credit policies in order to facilitate the mobility of student without penalty. In accepting transfer credits to fulfill degree requirements, the institution certifies that the expected learning outcomes for transferred courses are comparable to the learning outcomes of its own courses. The institution has articulation agreements as with public and private colleges and universities. In order to support student success, the college has partnered with California State University, San Bernardino to develop the Roadmaps to Degree Completion for four degrees (Administration of Justice, Business Administration, Communications, and Mathematics). Each Roadmap helps identify early coursework for students at COD to improve degree completion. (II.A.10; ER 10)

Through a review of Course Outlines of Record, course syllabi, institutional learning outcomes, GE learning outcomes, and interviews with members of the Outcomes and Assessment Committee the team established that College of the Desert includes learning outcomes appropriate to the program level, in communication competency, information competency,

quantitative competency, analytic inquiry skills, ethical reasoning, the ability to engage diverse perspectives, and other program-specific learning outcomes. The Outcomes and Assessment Handbook, the college webpage, and college catalog describe these outcomes. The college collects data on institution level outcomes (ILOs) using CCSSE and has found that students that have completed more units report higher achievement on the ILOs in the areas noted above. (II.A.11)

Based on a review of the catalog and degree program descriptions, as well as through interviews with faculty and the Curriculum Committee, College of the Desert degree programs include a component of general education, which is based on a carefully considered philosophy for associate degrees and relies on faculty expertise to determine the appropriateness of each course for inclusion in the general education curriculum. Learning outcomes help prepare students for responsible participation in civil society, skills for lifelong learning, and comprehension in the areas of arts & humanities, the sciences, mathematics, and social sciences. (II.A.12, ER 12)

A review of the college catalog and ISER demonstrates that all degree programs contain a focused area of study in at least one area of inquiry or in an established interdisciplinary core. Courses included within the degree reflect mastery of key theories and practices within the field of study. For example, the Administration of Justice AS-T includes coverage of criminal law, the criminal justice system, and court processes. Similarly, the AA-T in Art History requires students to develop skills in drawing and design and an understanding of the history of art across multiple time periods and cultures. (II.A.13)

Graduates completing career-technical certificates and degrees demonstrate technical and professional competencies that meet employment standards and other applicable standards and preparation for external licensure and certification. A review of the course catalog, PRUs, and interviews with Career Technical Education (CTE) faculty confirm the attention given to demonstration of these competencies. Advisory committees are actively involved in guiding the development of new certificates and the development of PLOs. CTE faculty work with community, industry, and regulatory agencies to ensure courses and programs meet existing and emerging expectations of their fields. For example, the team attended a meeting of the Curriculum Committee where two new emerging programs were presented; Building Commission Technician Certificate of Achievement and Building Energy Consultant Certificate of Achievement. Both programs were developed to meet new standards for residential and commercial energy usage. Community advisory groups in the Mecca/Thermal area shared the need and interest in agricultural certificates directly relatable to their population. Faculty members in CTE programs meet with advisory groups composed of industry professionals annually or more often to discuss programs and alignment with industry standards. A review of course descriptions indicates that students in CTE programs are prepared for licensing exams conducted by external agencies. In addition to the College's program review cycle, CTE course review is completed every two years for each CTE program to ensure programs are providing adequate preparation for students to meet employment standards and licensure or certification requirements. (II.A.14)

Administrative Procedure 4021 outlines the COD process for program discontinuance. The efficacy of this procedure has not been tested in recent years, as COD has not discontinued any certificates or degrees during the most recent accreditation cycle. (II.A.15)

Review of the College of the Desert's evidence shows that the college has an established program review cycle with full program reviews being completed every 5 years and updates being completed annually. The program review process requires analysis of enrollment data, demographic data, student achievement data, identification of program needs, resources required, and areas for improvement. The college is working to improve its program review process. Beginning in the 2018, the program review process will include connecting program goals to the college mission and a review of how program learning outcomes tie to institutional learning outcomes. The new process will contain a stronger mechanism for curricular review, assessment planning, and strategic planning. Some of these planning mechanisms existed in the previous program review process but the new program review process fills in gaps with regards to strategic planning, connecting to the college mission, and assessment of program outcomes. (II.A.16)

Conclusions
The college meets Standard II.A and ERs 2, 3, 9, 10, 11, and 12.

Recommendations for Compliance
None.

Recommendations for Improvement

College Recommendation 3 (Improvement)
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the revisions to the program student learning outcomes for all degree and certificate programs. In addition, the College should ensure full and regular analysis and dialogue concerning course, program, and institutional student learning outcome data. (I.A.2, I.A.3, II.A.3)

Standard II.B – Library and Learning Support

General Observations
College of the Desert provides sufficient services, resources, staff, expertise, and evaluation of services to support student success, all of which welcome and engage students in learning. The library and the Tutoring and Academic Skills Center (TASC) provide a range of print and electronic media, academic lab facilities, support and reference staff, instruction and drop-in academic support. Additionally, learning support services exist in discipline and program areas on the main campus, with training and support specific to students using those services.
The libraries and TASC are responsive and well equipped to meet needs of current students as well as to be prepared for the changes required, and afforded, in a facility relocation for both departments in the near future.

Findings and Evidence
The College of the Desert provides learning environments at libraries at the Palm Desert and Indio campuses, and at Tutoring and Academic Skills Center (TASC) labs at Palm Desert, Indio, Mecca/Thermal and Desert Hot Springs locations. The Palm Desert library is open 57 hours per week, offering 54 computers for student use, with substantial print and e-resource collections, a variety of spaces for student studying and collaboration, and consultation offered with librarians in person, by phone, through online chat, or email. The library offers information literacy workshops during the semester as communicated on the library website. . Interviews confirm that faculty collaborate as they build customized tutorials and new learning assessment tools. The library is located within a multi-agency building also housing a branch of the Riverside County Library System, through which the library contracts circulation services. The library shares this facility in a creative, responsive, inclusive way. During certain times of year, the available space is inadequate for student need; a new library and learning resource facility is scheduled to open in 2019 and both library and TASC staff have been giving input on the planning process. The opportunities the relocation will make available for programming, instruction, collection development, and even greater integration in the academic life of the College will be significant. (II.B.1)

The team confirmed through evidence, site visits, and interviews that the recently opened Indio library site extends services to students using that campus and is open 28 hours per week, offering students computers, study space, a small print material collection, as well as course reserve materials. Librarians and staff are available to students in Indio. The services are well utilized and were the product of considered analysis of community needs. At the Mecca/Thermal and Desert Hot Springs sites, course reserves materials are available and support staff maintain statistics for materials use. Students at any site, or working online, can now utilize a 24/7 reference chat that services all College of the Desert students through its website, dramatically extending the reach, responsiveness and efficiency of services of the library to the College community. The library staff are actively implementing efficient and responsive services such as the recently instituted chat service as well as course and discipline specific resources. (II.B.1)

The Tutoring and Academic Skills Center is a key learning support service for the College, and each site of College of the Desert provides a TASC lab. Each lab is open for a significant number of hours to meet the needs of students at that location. The labs differ by location but in general provide study and collaborative spaces, tutoring assistance, materials, laptops, desktop computers with course related software, and other equipment and tools to study individually or with assisted learning. The labs are actively used; unique student visits to TASC services increased 22 percent during the 2016-17 academic year. Classified, faculty, and student workers and tutors are engaged and responsive. Tutoring is largely done by peer tutors, who are recommended and interviewed by faculty. Tutors receive training support by faculty liaisons from several major disciplines, on-site at three of the four sites. Tutoring is available for a wide variety of disciplines, with emphasis on math, sciences, modern languages, and American Sign Language. Additionally, tutoring in reading and writing in all disciplines is available. The College provides 24/7 online tutoring through Smarthinking. (II.B.1, ER 17)

Evidence confirmed student and faculty input is included in selection and maintenance of equipment and materials, such as providing increasingly a greater number of online resources. The relocation planned in order to provide for a bigger location at the Palm Desert campus will allow for both TASC and library service expansion and has included student and faculty input. Recent program review and prioritization processes changes have prompted a better articulation of institutional needs, resulting in requests from instructional departments related to the library and learning support center, such as a recent request from the Chemistry faculty for a specific website to be included in a LibGuide developed by a liaison librarian. The library collection includes carefully selected new materials, chosen with faculty input, and existing materials are reviewed for currency, usefulness and delivery. The planned relocation to the center of campus will create more collection management opportunities as materials will be retained or deaccessioned in the move. TASC offers course-specific software and equipment, as well as trained personnel to assist students, and discipline faculty and staff, who review and select materials. (II.B.2)

The libraries and TASCs collect data and evaluate services. The library has developed library SLO/SSOs and course SLOs for the LIS-001 course, and it is establishing a new, online method to assess their SLOs. Through interviews, the team confirmed that ensuring that regular assessment of library SLOs is a department priority. Library faculty review, implement, and refine tools and techniques for gathering data in order to assess student achievement in instruction and at service areas. The emerging and enhanced college tools and processes, such as PEP, will offer the library opportunities to make student learning outcome data and its analysis available, in order to more clearly connect the role of library services, staff, and resources with campus-wide goals, particularly student success. (II.B.3)

That TASC regularly assesses SLOs and improvement of services based on evaluation is evident. TASC staff use information from student surveys, focus groups, and workshop evaluations to modify workshops for students and to improve training for tutors. Evidence shows that students surveyed after using TASC report that they would recommend the service to other students. Overall success rates for students using TASC is significantly higher than for non-TASC students. Newly implemented assessment tools and reports will offer TASC opportunities to make student learning outcome data and its analysis available, in order to connect library services, staff, and resources with campus-wide goals, particularly the role in student success, more clearly. (II.B.3)

The library and TASC document formal agreements with other institutions or sources of services and resources responsibly, and evaluates these services. The College's Education Technology Public Safety, and Maintenance and Operations departments coordinate to provide effective maintenance and security for the library and other learning support services, equipment and facilities. (II.B.4, ER17)

Conclusions
The College meets Standard II.B and ER 17.

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement
None

Standard IIC: Student Support Services

General Observations
The College demonstrates a strong commitment to support services with an array of support services for student success both on-ground as well as online. The Student Support Services programs and areas covers a wide variety of comprehensive services for students enrolled. Services include Admissions and Records (A&R), Assessment, CalWORKS, Career & Workforce Solutions Center, Counseling Services, Disabled Students Programs and Services (DSP&S), EDGE Program (First Year Experience), EOPS/Care, Financial Aid, Foster Youth Services, Intensive English Academy, International Education Program, Student Health and Wellness, MESA, Student Life, Transfer Services, TRIO ACES, TRIO DSPS, TRIO Veterans, TRIO Talent Search, TRIO Upward Bound, Tutoring & Academy Skills Center, and the Veterans Resource Center.

All core services are available at the main campus, housed in the new state of the art Cravens Student Services Center, located at the campus entrance and is accessible to students with disabilities. Services are extended at the three other campus locations, and any student has access to an array of online support services. For example, students can remotely complete the Admissions and Records & Financial Aid requirements online through the student portal, which is authenticated. Counseling services can be accessed through the phone and by email, and the counseling department is working on placing its forms online through the portal as well. Orientation and Bursar Office functions are also offered in an online format. A comprehensive list of student services offered at COD can be found on the College's website.

Findings and Evidence
College of the Desert has an evaluation processes in place to measure the quality of its student support services. Every student services program is evaluated annually through the Program Review Updates. Both General Counseling and Disabled Students Programs and Services offer courses that are evaluated every five years. Student Support Services align with the institutional mission as outlined in the College's 2013 Enrollment Management Plan and dashboard Indicator Report. As part of the planning process at COD, all academic and nonacademic student services areas complete yearly program review updates. In addition, programs with an academic component complete academic program reviews every five years. Each program conducts assessments on a rotating cycle. (II.C.1, ER 15)

Student Services Outcomes (SSOs) are imbedded in the Program Review Updates (PRUs). The Vice President of Student Success sends out reminders to student affairs leaders and managers to ensure submission of PRUs and evaluation of SSOs. The PRUs include program information, the assessment of SLOs/SSOs that includes evaluation of services, request for positions, equipment, resources as well as documented improvements that enhances student development and student success. Based on data embedded in the PRUs, all SSOs have been identified and evaluated. The programs and services in Student Services are in their fifth cycle of assessment. College of the

Desert student support services programs use a myriad of assessment tools for identifying and assessing student services outcomes for their student population and then use that data to provide appropriate student support services programs to achieve those outcomes. Each individual program uses the data to improve performance. The results collected by the different assessment methods are compared to the student learning outcomes and other elements outlined in the program review updates. Student support services programs complete an assessment report biannually. (II.C.2)

A sample of the evidence of assessment includes the general counseling SSO "Students who participate in general counseling services and develop a student education plan (SEP) with their counselor will have an understanding of the requirements to earn a certificate, graduate, and transfer," which evaluates understanding and services of the workshops and the student educational plan. Based on the evaluation of assessment data, counseling implemented several strategies to improve student development and services, including key changes to the My First Schedule Workshop. The process now requires all students to complete the online orientation prior to completing the assessment and attending the My First Schedule Workshop, Counseling's version of a flipped classroom. Students are now able to learn online about academic programs, support services, student life, campus safety, policies and procedures, campus locations, and assessment prior to attending a workshop. The online format allows students to learn the information at their own pace, and the information remains accessible to them at all times. Previously, this information was included in the My First Schedule Workshop or in a separate workshop on the same day. (II.C.2)

Student support services are offered at all campus locations and include counseling and advising which complement services from other departments: assessment testing, registration assistance, admissions and records, bookstore services, financial aid workshops, library services, health and wellness services, and transfer and career workshops. An example of how equitable services were ensured was the recent addition of unique technical systems, which were put in place in 2016 at Mecca/Thermal and Desert Hot Springs to ensure access to online assessment services to students in those locations. The Equity Committee (CPC handbook) serves as an advisory body related to equity, diversity, and basic skills issues. This committee has supported the work of a variety of initiatives such as SEED and EDGE. The EDGE Program is a first-year program that begins in the summer with a fast-paced review of basic skills in Math and/or English for new and continuing students who placed below college level courses on their assessment test and have not taken a math and/or English course. After the initial sessions, students in EDGE receive ongoing support throughout their first year including follow up calls, workshops, EDGE club events and informational emails. This program has grown from a few dozen students during its start up to 1200 students in 2017. Assessment data shows that students in the EDGE program have greater overall success in English compared to other first-time COD students. A recently initiated Promise program (plEDGE) offers local high school student graduates (or equivalent) from the Coachella Valley two full years of free tuition and fees. Students accepted into this program receive priority registration, commit to full time enrollment, as well as participation in 10 hours of community service, mentoring or internships, career preparation and must maintain good academic standing. The first cohort, as of fall 2017, has 1004 students. (II.C.3, ER 15)

Co-curricular and athletic programs reflect the mission of the College and are conducted with sound policy, integrity, and responsibility. The Athletic Department offers programs to a diverse group of students in an environment that embraces and promotes gender and cultural diversity among all involved; consistent with the values of COD. The Athletics Department meets the California Community College Athletics Association (CCCAA) Title IX Gender Equity Compliance Guidelines by fully and effectively accommodating the athletic sports request for the underrepresented gender (female athletes). The College offers seven men's sports and eight women's sports with the newest sport being Women's Beach Volleyball. The Athletics program has gone through improvement over the past 4 years by implementing checks and balances as it relates to student-athlete eligibility and the recruitment of student-athletes. The college has approved the hiring of a full-time Eligibility Specialist who assists student-athletes with the eligibility process as well as tracks and maintains student-athlete eligibility files for compliance. The Athletic Director has also implemented compliance trainings, out-of-state recruitment guidelines, regular eligibility meetings, and decorum trainings for all head coaches. In addition, local high school recruitment is a priority for all team sports. (II.C.4)

The Office of Student Life is dedicated to developing student life and co-curricular programming, including supporting the Associated Students of College of the Desert (ASCOD), campus tours, and the President's Ambassador Program. ASCOD provides co-curricular programs on campus. ASCOD coordinates co-curricular activities, including club rush, social and cultural events, and a town hall on current events. In addition, ASCOD charters student clubs and organizations supporting more student engagement across all college locations. The ASCOD are the main student organization that appoint students to serve on College governance committees. (II.C.4)

MESA (Math, Engineering, and Science Achievement) Program is a grant-funded program for math, engineering, science or computer science students with a strong desire to transfer to a four-year institution and continue their education. The Goal of the MESA Program is to increase the number of students successfully transferring to four-year colleges as Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM) majors. MESA serves educationally and financially disadvantaged students and emphasizes participation by students from groups that are traditionally underrepresented in STEM fields at four-year schools. (II.C.4).

The mission to support the exploration and development of the academic, career, and personal goals of all students drives College of the Desert counseling services. COD counselors are professional, credentialed faculty who assist students to effectively and successfully progress through the educational process. Evidence and interviews confirm that COD counseling faculty and staff are committed to providing all students with equal access to an array of counseling services, such as educational planning, career exploration, personal counseling, and transfer counseling. COD provides counseling and advising services to support student development and success and provides counseling and advising programs to ensure that students receive timely, useful, and accurate information about relevant academic requirements, including graduation and transfer policies. Counselors meet twice a month and offer in-service training once a month. Counselors are crossed trained to work with a variety of student populations. The Department is currently working on an online counselor training handbook as well as developing more online counseling courses and services. (II.C.5)

College of the Desert has received five Federally Funded TRIO grants, including the TRIO Talent Search grant, that provide support services for high school and college students pursuing an associate and/or baccalaureate degrees. (II.C.5)

College of the Desert has governing board approved admission policies (BP 5010) that are consistent with its mission. The policy specifies the qualifications of students appropriate for academic programs. The College defines and guides students on clear pathways beginning with core services. Through orientation, assessment, comprehensive counseling, student educational planning, and access to a full array of student services, COD supports students in understanding and achieving their educational goals. The Counseling Department has also developed clear course pathways for mathematics, engineering, and all science programs. (II.C.6, ER 16)

As part of the Student Success and Support Program (SSSP), students are required to meet with a counselor and develop a Student Education Plan (SEP). In 2015, counselors piloted SEP workshops to accommodate the large numbers of students who will need SEPs. As of 2016, there has been full implementation of SEP workshops and counselors continue to work with students to complete SEPs individually as well. The College has also implemented an online student planning module that stores their SEPs electronically, monitors their progress and timelines to complete their goals, displays and stores their course schedules, and maintains their advising notes, petitions, and waivers. As of fall 2016, there has been a 176 percent increase in students receiving education plan services since 2014. The development of future class scheduling uses data collected from SEPs. (II.C.6)

College of the Desert does not use instruments to determine student admission. COD uses ACCUPLACER to assess student placement for English, mathematics, reading, and English as a second language course sequences. Content validity studies for English and math placement were completed in fall 2006 and 2008. (II.C. 7)

In accordance with Board Policy 5040, student records are permanently and securely maintained. The Admissions and Records Office maintain student records. The College adheres to the California Code of Regulations in regard to the type of records that must be retained. All student records are kept in an imaged format in the College's imaging system, AMI Laserfishe. The College publishes the Student Records and Privacy Act Policy online and in the COD catalog, covering the policy for the release of records. In addition, the College notifies actively enrolled students of the Student Records and Privacy Act Policy via email during the first week of both the fall and spring terms. To ensure this policy is followed, College of the Desert has centralized student record requests with the Admissions and Records Office. (II.C.8)

Conclusions
The College meets Standard II.C and ERs 2, 15, and 16.

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement
None

Standard III
Resources

Standard III.A Human Resources

General Observations
College of the Desert has shown significant growth over the last few years, both in student enrollment and number of employees. The District hires qualified faculty, staff, and administrators. Turnover in the Human Resources department, and in management over the last few years, has caused some issues related to completion of evaluations. The College now has a full staff of permanent managers, and is being proactive in developing processes and professional development opportunities to support the training needs of the growing college. All members of the College interviewed by the visiting team expressed a deep and sincere interest in assuring the integrity and quality of the programs and services provided by the College.

Findings and Evidence
College of the Desert has well-documented evidence that it employs qualified faculty, classified, and administrative personnel and the criteria, qualifications and procedures for employment are clearly and publicly stated. The visiting team found specific board policies and administrative procedures governing the hiring and necessary qualifications for academic, classified, and administrative personnel, including BP/AP 7120 (Recruitment and Hiring), BP/AP 7210, 7230,7240, 7250, 7260 (Academic, Classified, Confidential, Educational Administrators, Classified Supervisors and Managers minimum qualifications). These policies and procedures are also available on the COD website. (III.A.1)

College of the Desert faculty job descriptions include the appropriate degrees and experience criteria, including knowledge of the subject matter. Job descriptions include development and review of curriculum as well as assessment of student learning. The institution has a sufficient number of qualified faculty, which includes full-time faculty as well as adjunct faculty, to achieve the institution's mission and purposes. (III.A.2, ER 14)

College of the Desert follows board policies and procedures that ensure administrators and all other employees responsible for education programs and services possess qualifications and experience necessary to sustain institutional effectiveness and academic quality. Each job announcement includes the minimum qualifications and required education and experience. The Department of Human Resources reviews transcripts of applicants to ensure they meet the minimum educational qualifications. (III.A.3)

College of the Desert employs personnel who possess the necessary academic degrees from accredited institutions and requires others to establish equivalency and/or foreign transcript evaluation. The team found evidence of policies regarding equivalencies from non-U.S. educational institutions, as well as for non-teaching equivalencies, including the utilization of state Academic Senate minimum qualifications for both faculty and administrators. Job announcements include a hyperlink to explain the foreign equivalency process for degrees earned outside the United States. A foreign evaluation is required for any foreign course work used to

meet minimum qualifications. (III.A.4)

College of the Desert has established systems for performance evaluation of full-time faculty, adjunct faculty, classified staff, confidential employees, and administrators. The employees' personnel files include documentation of evaluations and any follow-up actions. BP/AP 2435 outline the evaluation process for the superintendent/president. Evidence confirmed that the annual evaluation of the superintendent/president. The team confirmed through interviews that evaluations seek to assess effectiveness of academic personnel and encourage improvement. All tenured faculty are evaluated once every three years, as outlined in the contract between the District and CODFA (College of the Desert Faculty Association). Probationary/tenure-track, non-tenure track (categorically funded), and temporary full-time faculty are comprehensively evaluated annually for the first four years. Tenure committees include faculty and administrators. Adjunct faculty are evaluated during their first or second semester, and then regularly once every three years. The College tracks adjunct and full-time faculty evaluation records using Ellucian, the student information system. . Evidence confirmed that full-time and adjunct faculty evaluations are current. (III.A.5)

The contract between the District and California School Employees Association (CSEA) outlines the evaluation process for classified staff. Administrative Procedure 7150 states the procedures for the leadership group. Classified staff and educational administrators share common evaluation processes and expectations; it is expected that they are evaluated for their first two years and then every other year. There are annual evaluations for confidential employees. The team confirmed through interviews that several of the classified and administrator evaluations are past due. The College recently found that due to the elimination of an electronic tracking system, their monitoring and communication process was not working. The College has purchased a new electronic tracking system and is working to implement the new process with the expectation of eliminating the current backlog of evaluations. Based on interviews and evidence, the visiting team found that the Office of Human Resources has increased staffing and hired a permanent Director of Human Resources, and is currently working with administrators to ensure the completion of outstanding evaluations. Professional development is the focus of the College Quality Focus Essay Project Two. Based on interviews, the team confirmed that the QFE action steps include professional development training related to Human Resource processes and evaluations to support timely, consistent evaluations for all employees. (III.A.5)

College of the Desert provides evidence that the evaluation of full-time and adjunct faculty, as well as academic administrators and other personnel directly responsible for improved teaching and learning, have, as a component of that evaluation, examination of the results of the assessment of student learning outcomes to improve teaching and learning. The two collective bargaining agreements provide these expectations for faculty. Appendix G of the agreement between the institution and CSEA requires that, when applicable, classified employees will self-reflect on their participation in the assessment of student learning outcomes. The visiting team inspected the performance review format for Superintendent/President and Vice President, Student Learning, and found those documents to be consistent with the Standard. (III.A.6)

College of the Desert states it has sufficient faculty members to ensure the quality of educational programs and services to achieve its mission and purposes. The College continues to hire

additional full-time and adjunct faculty to meet its enrollment growth needs. The number of full-time faculty hired by the Desert Community College District has exceeded its "faculty obligation number" (FON) requirement from the State Chancellor's Office for the last two years. The College follows a well-established, documented process for faculty prioritization. The process has been evaluated and improved consistently over the last three years. The faculty prioritization process and criteria used includes section counts, FTES, FTEF, enrollment data analysis, growth, fill rates, and the Program Review Updates. The Faculty Prioritization Committee prioritizes faculty positions and forwards them to the College Planning Council and superintendent/president, who makes the final decision. The superintendent/president announces the funded faculty positions. (III.A.7)

College of the Desert encourages part-time faculty to participate in the institution's governance and professional development opportunities and compensates them for service on academic committees. Adjunct faculty receive an employee orientation and have access to the faculty handbook. Faculty, chairs, and deans, provide oversight and guide and mentor them in the development of course syllabi and assessment of student learning outcomes.

Evidence confirmed the regular evaluation of adjunct faculty. Adjunct faculty are encouraged to attend Flex activities and the District compensates them for 12 hours of Flex activities per semester. The District also pays adjunct faculty to participate on Academic Senate and other participatory governance committees, and for attendance at District-approved committee meetings. (III.A.8)

Interviews with faculty and staff confirm that the College has sufficient number of staff with appropriate qualifications to support the educational, technological, physical, and administrative operations of the institution. The College has grown significantly over the last few years and the College has increased the number of classified staff from 207 in fall 2014 to 265 in fall 2016. During on-campus interviews, interviewees expressed that, in recent years, the Human Resources department was understaffed which was affecting the time required to fill new positions, particularly classified. In response to this need, during the fall 2017 classified prioritization process, administration approved an additional Human Resources Technician position. (III.A.9, ER 8)

Evidence confirmed that the College maintains a sufficient number of administrators with the appropriate qualifications and experience to support the institution's mission and goals. Evidence and interviews confirm that as of spring 2016, the College has a full, permanent executive team in place. As enrollment has grown, the College has hired additional administrators to support the needs of the students, faculty, and staff. The number of administrators has grown from 33 in fall 2014 to 49 in 2016. This increase in administration supports the expansion of programs college-wide and the expansion of instructional sites.

Through interviews, College of the Desert noted that the Human Resources department, in cooperation with other college groups, is working on a College-wide Staffing Plan, which is included in the latest Master Plan for Education (Goal 6.2). As described in the Master Plan, the College-wide Staffing Plan focuses on equity and diversity. (III.A.10, ER 8)

College of the Desert's employment and evaluation procedures are public and consistently administered. Through evidence and interviews, the visiting team confirmed that the College follows board policies and procedures established and reviewed through participatory governance processes outlined in the College Planning Council Handbook. The superintendent/president initially reviews policies and procedures. After the executive cabinet reviews them, they are forwarded to the College Planning Council for review. CPC then forwards recommendations for change to the Board of Trustees. Board Policy 2410 references the necessity for policies to be consistent with law. And AP 2410 requires the College to follow processes that help ensure policies and procedures are fair, equitable, and consistently administered. The College has a grievance process in place. (III.A.11)

College of the Desert creates and maintains appropriate programs, practices, and services that support its diverse personnel. The District's mission statement focuses on diversity. The Student Equity Plan includes activities to foster professional development for faculty related to the first-year experience program and to increase female enrollment in STEM majors. The Diversity and Equity Council, a committee of the College Planning Council, is an advisory body on issues of equity and diversity. The committee is composed of a broad constituent group, and meets regularly to plan and support diversity at the College through events, workshops, and training opportunities. The Diversity and Equity Council has embraced and adopted the faculty SEED (Seeking Educational Equity and Diversity) to create conversational communities to drive change. The College superintendent/president has also shown a commitment to diversity through a College community statement of COD values of inclusiveness and diversity. (III.A.12)

The College is currently updating its Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Plan. As required by AP 7100, all members of a screening/interviewing committee receive EEO training. The College also provides a variety of trainings, such as ethics, harassment, and Title IX. The through interviews, the visiting found that the recent hiring of a permanent Vice President of Human Resources is providing leadership that will continue to improve and strengthen these practices. (III.A.12)

Board Policies 2200 and 2715 and Administrative Procedure 3050 establish policies and procedures that define ethical standards and practices for all employees, including penalties for violations. Board policies 3410, 3430, 7360, and 7365, define policies that prohibit discrimination, harassment, and other impermissible behavior by all COD employees, as well as procedures for investigation of complaints and discipline, including dismissal. BP and AP 5500 describes Standards of Student Conduct. BP/AP 5520 and 5530 outline student rights and responsibilities, discipline procedures, and grievances. (III.A.13)

The District promotes professional development offerings for all personnel, documented in BP and AP 7160, consistent with the mission, and based on planning. College of the Desert's Strategic Master Plan includes a focus on professional development under Goal 4: Teamwork, Organizational Development. The college bargaining agreements also include College support for professional development activities. The College offers a wide variety of professional development opportunities for faculty, such as course instruction and evaluation, learning resources, student services, conferences, workshops, and department meetings. Evidence shows that faculty Flex activities cover a wide range of topics, including pedagogy, technology, and

improved online and classroom instruction. The Faculty Development Committee (FDC) of the Academic Senate allocates funds dedicated by the college to support faculty development. The FDC's goal is to foster student engagement, learning, and success for diverse student populations. The College also received donated resources that allowed it to establish the Berger Faculty Innovation Center, which provides training and professional development opportunities. The Diversity and Equity Council also hosts and supports a variety of professional development activities and workshops, including faculty SEED leader training and guest speakers. The College Student Equity Plan includes several professional activities. (III.A.14)

Evidence confirmed that the Office of Human Resources provides a variety of mandatory and optional trainings for all employees on topics such as ethics, harassment, discrimination, FERPA, and Title IX. The online employee portal allows access to the trainings. The College conducts employee surveys and uses the results to guide professional development training for areas such as technology and distance education. Over the last few years, several leadership vacancies affected the Office of Human Resources' ability to support the expanding professional development needs of the College. These positions have now been filled permanently and the College has a plan, included in the Quality Focus Essay, to consolidate professional development efforts, develop a calendar of professional development events, and evaluate these activities. The QFE focus resulted from the College self-assessment process, which included a review of college-wide professional development opportunities. According the Self-Evaluation Report, the College found that with the addition of the Berger Faculty Innovation Center, faculty received more professional development opportunities, but there were gaps for classified and leadership training opportunities. The QFE includes actions and a timeline to provide comprehensive and coordinated professional development opportunities for all college employees. (III.A.14)

College of the Desert takes due diligence in protecting the security and confidentiality of its personnel records in accordance with law. Personnel records are maintained in locked cabinets in the Office of Human Resources. Confidentiality requirements are included in Board policy, administrative regulations, and collective bargaining agreements. (III.A.15)

Conclusions
College of the Desert has enjoyed record levels of new student enrollment, which is reflected in the expansion in the number of employed persons. The College provides a variety of professional development opportunities for faculty, staff, and leadership. The College seeks institutional quality improvement, as outlined in Quality Focus Essay Action Project Two, by providing comprehensive, coordinated professional development opportunities for all college employees. The College meets Standard III.A and ERs 8 and 14.

Recommendations for Compliance
None.

Recommendations for Improvement

College Recommendation 4 (Improvement)
In order to improve, the team recommends that the College complete the implementation of its employee evaluation tracking process and associated training in order to ensure performance evaluations are completed in a timely manner. (III.A.5)

Standard III.B Physical Resources

General Observations
College of the Desert, a single-college district with multiple campuses located in the eastern part of the Coachella Valley at both Indio/Thermal and Mecca, a central campus at Palm Desert, and a west campus at Desert Hot Springs, serves over 15,000 students. Dual enrollment instruction also occurs at area high schools, which includes sharing of equipment and supplies. Administrative services provides oversight of facilities, maintenance, and operations of the college's campuses.

According to the Secretary of the Associated Students, College of the Desert is the most rapidly-growing community college in the state of California. Planned expansion of the campuses has been managed to date with bond funds from Measure B, with appropriate oversight of college administration and the contracting firm, MAAS Companies, through a committee composed of external stakeholders. Measure CC funds will replace Measure B funds in order to ensure uninterrupted service toward facilities management and planned capital improvement projects. The College has built and successfully maintains strong ties to the community, and enjoys the robust support of the community. An example of this is passage of the new bond measure, Measure CC that will replace Measure B, allowing capital improvements at the campuses to continue without interruption. New buildings have been designed to meet the needs of students and programs, and innovative, interdisciplinary classrooms have been created that allow physiology, art, and anthropology instruction, for example, to occur in the same classroom.

The College utilizes several planning documentary tools, including the Facilities Master Plan, the Strategic Master Plan, and the Educational Master Plan, each of which has been created using shared-governance processes. The College is dedicated to supporting student success in ways that also build fiscal stability and infrastructure of the entire organization. The College works closely with external stakeholders and hired consultants to ensure that facilities are built or modified in high-need areas and that new programs reflect the needs of the greater Coachella Valley. Long-range capital plans directly support institutional improvement goals and objectives.

Findings and Evidence
The College ensures that facilities are readily accessible to staff and students. Annual inspection of college facilities by an outside auditor as well as monthly in-house facilities inspections ensure that existing equipment is well maintained or replaced in a timely manner. The College has worked with local transportation authorities to ensure that bus routes accommodate students and that free bus passes are available to students at all campuses. The Director, Education Centers, who reports to the Vice President of Administrative Services, oversees the various campuses and ensures that all programming is available to students, including DSP&S, A&R, Tutoring, and Library Services, and that sufficient courses are available to students to support their educational goals in terms of earning degrees and certificates. The College website displays safety information, such as the Emergency Response Guide, crime logs, and other information related to public safety. Online safety training is available to staff through Keenan's 'Safe Colleges Training.' Additionally, an active student government body, concerned with ensuring the safety, support, and success of students, works actively and reports to the College Planning

Council. The Public Safety Committee monitors safety of students and staff. The Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee oversees Bond measures. MAAS Companies, the Vice President of Administrative Services, Facilities Committee, and others work closely with the oversight committee. (III.B.1)

The College has proven to be nimble in its response to the various economic and workforce conditions of its constituent communities; when the economic downturn did not bring the population growth projected to occur in the Mecca area, the College conducted further population studies and refocused growth efforts to the Indio campus in order to match projected need. At the same time, rather than allow the Mecca campus to languish, the College redoubled its efforts in the community, continuing to build out the farming program and partnering with farming corporations to create internship opportunities for students, to ensure that students have access to the educational opportunities that are of interest. The Mecca campus now has a wet-lab, dry-lab, and classrooms in support of farming and environmental science programming, as well as general education courses. (III.B.1)

Interviews and team site visit observations confirmed that facilities for online and hybrid education are a component of instruction at each campus and are included in current and future facilities planning, in order to facilitate continued access to multiple learning modalities for students. The Educational Technology (ET) department is extremely responsive to students and staff needs for services. Through interviews, the team learned that in the 2016-2017 academic year, the ET department successfully responded to in excess of 5200 service ticket requests related to technology use, access of equipment, and facilities. Additionally, the College exhibits large-scale multi-disciplinary use of facilities, illustrating strong and robust programmatic integration and faculty-staff collaboration. An example is the Early Childhood Education program, which occupies a large facility with a ¼-acre organic garden that provides top-quality childcare and integrated, innovative programming through collaboration with the Culinary Arts, Agricultural, and Nutrition Departments. (III.B.1, III.B.2).

The District has completed many projects with Measure B funds. Evidence and interviews confirmed that the community showed its support for the College by approving the Measure CC Bond in November 2016, which will allow the College to continue to plan, build, and maintain its facilities. The Enrollment Management Committee provided input into the College Facilities Master Plan. The College is currently updating its Educational Master Plan and then will develop a new Facilities Master Plan. (III.B.2)

Equipment is requested and vetted through the Program Review Update process and requests are prioritized using a three-tier metric through the Equipment Prioritization Committee, the model of which was reviewed by the College Planning Council. The Maintenance and Operations Department maintains facilities through a work-order system in which work-orders are typically completed within a two-week timeframe. The College updates and maintains an inventory database of technology equipment. The effectiveness of equipment and facilities are evaluated using the Program Review Update process. (III.B.2, III.B.3)

Evidence and interviews confirm that the College evaluates its facilities on a regular basis. Facilities are modified when needs emerge in both traditional and distance-education teaching

modalities. For example, when the internet signal at the Mecca campus continued to wane intermittently in strength, a microwave booster was installed to boost the strength of the signal, allowing students continual and ready access to online instruction and other online resources. The College's strong linkage to its constituent communities is also expressed in the numerous partnerships between the College and various agencies and K-12 districts, as evidenced at the Desert Hot Springs campus. At this site, a continuation high school and College of the Desert share a campus and resources in support of the social and economic development of an economically disadvantaged area in the west valley, north of I-10. Facilities use is well planned and changes in use appear to be well executed and in alignment with the College's mission and goals. For example, the busy Tutoring Center, composed of three large interconnected rooms, has three service areas, English, Math and Science. In order to allow students to take control of their tutoring needs and scheduling, the Center includes a wall that displays photos of the tutors along with their schedule and availability. Utilizing a large tutoring space allows the College to quickly pivot and respond to students' needs. (III.B.3)

The College is planning for a new 20-year Facilities Master Plan, utilizing enrollment projections from the Enrollment Management Committee and labor market data from the California Employment Development Department (EDD) and the local workforce development boards. Other emerging programmatic and/or student needs are identified through ongoing collaboration between the College President, local Mayors, and Chambers of Commerce, and others involved in education and economic development, including staff in the Office of Institutional Research. The Assessment of Planning and Outcomes Subcommittee recently evaluated the 2003-2015 Facilities Master Plan, and presented the findings to the Facilities Advisory Committee and College Planning Council in anticipation of the new Facilities Master Plan. A five-year Technology Master Plan linked to the Educational Master Plan, Facilities Master Plan, and Strategic Master Plan, also supports appropriate procurement of equipment and technology in support of the College's mission and vision. The Budget Subcommittee, in the office of the Vice President of Administrative Services, identifies resources and makes recommendations to the superintendent/president The superintendent/president regularly reports to the Board of Trustees in open session regarding facilities management of the College of the Desert, the minutes of which are available on the College website. Annually, the College submits the Five-Year Capital Outlay Plan to the State Chancellor's Office. (III.A.4)

Two measures have provided long-range capital funding: Measure B, $346.5M and Measure CC, $577.8M, with strong community support. Decisions about programming and facilities management are made using robust shared governance planning processes, along with the Facilities Condition Assessment and the Space Inventory reports prepared by independent consultants. The College is proud of its capital improvements that were designed and successfully implemented to lower the total cost of ownership, such as the solar installation on the Palm Desert/Main campus. The Facilities Master Plan is created from the Educational Master Plan, and is utilized for bond/funding planning as well as long-term capital improvements. The connection of the Facilities Master Plan to the Educational Master Plan ensures that capital projects are in alignment with the mission, values, and goals of the College. The long-range planning captured in the Facilities Master Plan, 2003-2015, has largely been actualized, to the benefit of the College and surrounding communities. (III.B.4)

Conclusions
College of the Desert has made a significant effort to provide beautiful, sufficient, quality facilities at all locations. This is well-supported by evidence, interviews, and first-hand observation.

The College meets the Standard III.B.

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement
None

Standard III.C. Technology Resources

General Observations
College of the Desert engages in the widespread use of technology in the support of teaching and learning, student success, and management and operational functions. As summarized in the Technology Master Plan and annual Program Review Update, the eighteen members of the COD Information Technology department provide systems and services to support college-wide activities. Within a potentially challenging environment of increases in student enrollments, personal electronic devices, staffing, research needs, distance learning needs and operational sites, COD effectively navigates and expands its technology infrastructure to contribute to the success of its many stakeholders. Information technology is well supported at the Palm Desert campus, the additional three educational sites and the five partner highs schools. Technology-enhanced classrooms, computer labs and targeted technology trainings contribute to the learning environment throughout the College's service area. Through significant bond funding, COD has successfully upgraded its network infrastructure and operational systems. The Technology Replacement plan delineates the College's planning for and financial commitment to the updating of its technology infrastructure.

Findings and Evidence
The college solicits input from students, faculty and staff as a means of assessing the adequacy of technology. Through surveys and committee structures, technology support and training needs are identified. This data, in addition to observations of the physical sites, detailed information contained within the annual Information Technology Program Reviews and Technology Lists (compiled from all COD Program Review Updates), illustrates the College's ongoing commitment to its technology infrastructure. The technology vision, priorities and guiding principles stated within the Technology Master Plan appear to shape the delivery of information technology at College of the Desert. Through "an integrated, state-of-the-art information technology environment that sustains and enhances teaching and learning," COD successfully meets the institution's needs. (III.C.1)

Technology needs assessment and planning occurs in a variety of places at COD Individual Program Review Updates address specific technology needs. The Facilities Master Plans and prioritization processes of the College Planning Council address broader needs. Ultimately, the Technology Master Plan (TMP) serves as the primary planning document for COD's technology. The TMP aligns with the overall mission, vision and values of COD. Physical observations, interviews during the site visit and documentation accompanying the ISER confirm that COD is committed to updating and replacing its technological infrastructure, relying on a combination of bond and college funding. (III.C.2)

Rightly so, COD exercises an abundance of caution in managing the reliability, access, safety and security of its technology resources. The Network Operation Center, funded with Measure B bonds, is physically secured and structured to continue operations in the event of a power failure. The college employs redundancy in security, backup, storage and isolation protocols. Through HelpDesk and a customer-service orientation, the IT department manages the resolution of a variety of technology glitches at all COD learning sites. (III.C.3)

Through staff and faculty survey data, as well as student input provided via the Administrative Computing Committee, training needs are identified. These needs are met through online training videos, a quarterly newsletter, workshops, FLEX trainings and individual sessions. In addition, IT regularly offers "IT 101" each semester and presents to new faculty, as requested. Frequent questions or areas of confusion lead to the updating of website FAQs, when appropriate. The adoption of new technologies, such as the Canvas LMS, necessitates a more intensive and targeted round of training. The recent conversion to Canvas from BlackBoard clearly illustrates the ability of COD IT to support faculty and student. IT provided the necessary technological infrastructure to support Canvas, while collaborating with faculty to identify and meet student and faculty training needs. (III.C.4)

COD has a variety of policies and procedures designed to guide the appropriate use of technology. Specifically, Administrative Procedures 3720 and 4105 address the primary issues associated with the use of technology in learning environments and the workplace. Administrative procedures are reviewed and revised, as needed, to reflect changes in the technological environment. (III.C.5)

Conclusions
The College meets Standard III.C.

Recommendations for Compliance
None

Recommendations for Improvement
None

Standard III.D Financial Resources

General Observations
The college has an integrated planning process tied to the mission of the college. They have implemented strategies to deal with the long-term liabilities of the district, such as fully funding the OPEB liability. Educational and program support has benefited from reliable funding due to growth, community support with through bonds, a strong alumni association, and a growing foundation that all help support the college. The college is benefited by a strong fiscal leadership team which has a robust understanding of the complexities of facilities funding, instructional demand and the resulting revenue generation, as well as the state funding models and impacts.

Findings and Evidence
The college has benefited from funded growth and the state base increases for the last few years as evidenced by the State Chancellor's Office Exhibit "C" and 311Qs. This funding has allowed the college to support educational improvement and innovation. The college, foundation, and governmental obligation bond audits show that they are fiscally stable, perform fiscal processes with integrity, and management is responsive to findings or concerns. Evidence confirmed that the college uses their resource allocation model to identify program needs and fund the college priorities using the resources available. (III.D.1, III.D.4, ER 18)

Evidence confirmed that the program planning process now reflects the mission of the college. New program review processes were adopted by the OAC in spring 2017, which should enable the College to tie the resource requests in the future to the mission and goals of the college. (III.D.2, ER 18)

The budget processes and statuses are discussed at the Budget Advisory Committee, College Planning Council meetings and at the Board of Trustees meetings. The tentative and final budgets are made public for the community and college constituents. These are evidenced by discussions and dialogue during the site visit, at the Budget Advisory meetings, and also in the College Planning Council. (III.D.3, III.D.4, III.D.7)

The college has strong reserves to deal with fiscal downturns that result from state and local funding shortfalls. They have maintained reserve levels well above the state minimum requirement and have averaged over a 25 percent reserve in the last four years as evidenced by the 311Qs. (III.D.2, III.D.10, III.D.11, ER 18)

Evidence confirmed that constituent groups have the opportunity through the annual program review process to request additional resources. The process is reviewed by the areas and the area vice presidents before being forwarded to the college prioritization committees, the College Planning Council and then to the superintendent/president for the final decision. (III.D.3, III.D.4, ER 18)

The external audits have had only one finding, which was not fiscal in nature, in the last three years. This issue was communicated and corrected prior to the subsequent audit. This is an indication that the institution is compliant with the Budget and Accounting Standards set by the state, and the Eligibility Requirements set by the federal government. This compliance is

reflected in their general fund, Government Obligation Bond (GO Bonds), and state and federal grants audits. During interviews with the fiscal team, they shared some of the analytical methods they use to predict the current budget and the revenue potentials based on prior data, room capacity and a variety of other data. (III.D.5, 6, 7, 8, ER 18)

The district participates in a Joint Powers Authority Statewide Association of Community Colleges for property and liability claims. They have secured sufficient insurance to cover all major loss from claims as evidences by their policy. The college has a large reserve and other fiscal resources that allow it to have sufficient cash flows for stability of operations. (III.D.9)

The College has processes to review and implement controls over their grants, foundation and financial aid as evidenced through policies, practices and audits. They have dedicated staff to review the accuracy of transactions. For the foundation, there are practices in place for the funds may be transferred to ensure the integrity of the movement of funds. (III.D.10)

The community has passed two bonds Measure B and more recently Measure CC. These funds help with the long-term facilities costs. The district keeps appropriate debt schedules to properly report in the financial statements. They have a long-term practice of maintaining a reserve level that allows them to have sufficient cash flow for the stability of operations and the ability to plan long-term. (III.D.9, III.D.11, III.D.13)

The College's Other Post Employment Benefits (OPEB) liability was fully funded in 2016 which shows a commitment to long-term liabilities. The OPEB liability is evaluated every two years. The financial team is projecting STRS and PERS retirement liabilities five years ahead to allow for proper planning for these expected large increases and the effects that raises will have as a result (III.D.12).

The College has debt from the Measure B bond, and has yet to issue funds from the Measure CC bond. This repayment will be made from the taxpayers and does not affect the college's debt structure. With the refunding of prior bonds to reduce taxpayer debt, the college has shown a commitment to assessing and repayment of debt to benefit the taxpayers they serve. The college has few other outstanding debts which include copier leases, these contracts do not exceed more than five year leases, and supplemental early retirement plans which will expire in 2020. (III.D.13)

Auxiliary, foundation, bond and grant funds are monitored and audited to ensure that the uses are in line with the purpose of the funds. For the bond, the bond oversight committee has minutes available that show the review of projects as well as bond audits. Auxiliary activities are reviewed quarterly. The foundation director is required to be the final authorization prior to the release of foundation funds. These practices help to ensure that funds are not misused and show good internal control practices. (III.D.14)

COD has eliminated the student direct loan program. Prior to the discontinuance, they had a three-year default cohort rate of 22.5 percent, which was less than the 30 percent federal limit. They have not had any audit findings regarding their Pell grants and other federal awards. (III D.15)

When College of the Desert enters into a contract, they have contract evaluation processes which are found in the board policies and administrative procedures. The nature of the contract determines the criteria for evaluating a contract. Nonstandard contracts are assessed for risk and legal concerns. Contracts are also reviewed by the fiscal department for budgetary considerations. The Board of Trustees ratifies these contracts. (IIID.16)

Conclusions
The FTES for the college are growing which gives them additional resources to serve the students of the area. The College has fully funded the OPEB liability and is addressing the increases to the STRS/PERS expenses. The bonds, that the community has supported, will give the college the ability to grow and improve the campuses. The resource allocation process is tied to program and institutional planning, showing the commitment to integrated planning.

The college meets Standard III.D and ERs 5 and 18.

Recommendations for Compliance:
None.

Recommendations for Improvement:

College Recommendation 1
In order to increase effectiveness, the team recommends that the College complete the implementation of the recently improved Program Review process to ensure institutional mission, goals, and planning priorities are linked to resource allocation. (I.A.2, III.D.2)

Standard IV

IV.A.

General Observations

The College prides itself on sustaining a culture of continuous improvement and is committed to broad participation by all stakeholder groups. The College fosters an environment of inclusion that encourages innovation and institutional improvement. The College has well-documented policies and procedures that outline constituents' roles in planning and decision-making. The College has well defined and curriculum and student learning processes guided by clear board policies and administrative procedures. Decision-making processes and decisions are well documented.

Evidence and Findings

College leaders encourage wide participation and support planning, innovation, evaluation, and improvement that lead to institutional excellence. College of the Desert's participatory governance system is designed to increase participation and engagement of individuals from all the constituent groups. For example, the College's processes for self-evaluation and planning provide multiple venues for various stakeholder groups to participate. College Planning Council, the primary policy and planning recommendation group for the College supports decision-making with the broadest possible participation. Development of the Educational Master Plan and the review of College Planning Council are examples of activities that demonstrate the collaborative work of various constituencies. Numerous interviews by the visiting team with members of the different constituency groups along with the evidence provided, affirms the effectiveness of the participatory governance structure in supporting an environment that fosters institutional excellence through multiple avenues. (IV.A.1)

The college has a well-documented and updated set of policies and procedures that outline how the leadership works with the faculty and staff in the planning process and decision-making. The College provides information and evidence on the ability of the College community to participate in an open dialogue and an inclusive environment for decision-making. These policies and procedures include BP/AP 2510 (Participation in Local Decision Making), BP 2310 (Regular Meetings of the Board), BP 2311 (Reports at Board Meetings), BP 2345 (Public Participation at Board Meetings), BP 2340 (Delegation of Authority to the Superintendent/President), and BP/AP 3250 (Institutional Planning). (IV.A.2)

The College Planning Council Handbook describes the roles and responsibilities of all major stakeholder groups. BP/AP 5400 (Associated Student Organization) recognizes the association of ASCOD and its role as the official voice for students in the College decision-making process. The visit to the College confirmed the institution's inclusive culture and value of participatory governance among all groups. (IV.A.2)

Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 2510 define the roles in participatory governance, including faculty and administrator appointments. Board Policy 3250 requires a broad-based, comprehensive, systematic and integrated system of planning. Administrative Procedure 3250 establishes the College Planning Council as the primary participatory governance group for the College. The CPC Handbook clearly defines the structure and purpose of committees, their membership and forms of communication. The handbook also illustrates how recommendations

for resources and hiring are initiated from the units' evaluation of their needs in program review and/or annual updates and are then processed and prioritized through the administrators and committee structure to CPC before the Board of Trustees makes the final decisions. (IV.C. 3)

Curriculum and student learning at the institution are well defined and clearly articulated in many of the board policies and administrative procedures. The work is developed and evaluated by the college's Curriculum Committee of the academic senate, which has primary responsibility for the implementation of the policies. The curriculum review process includes consultation with the articulation officer, Outcomes and Assessment Committee and members of the Distance Education Subcommittee. Evidence provided to the team included procedures for faculty and administrators input and recommendations about curriculum and student learning programs and services. Faculty and administrators share responsibility for the recommendations on student learning programs and services through annual planning and program review process. The following board policies and administrative procedures are evidence of the well-established structure and articulation of responsibility: BP 4020 (Program and Curriculum Development), AP 4021 (Program Discontinuance), BP/AP 4025 (Philosophy and Criteria for Associate Degree and General Education), BP/AP 4040 (Library and Other Instructional Support Services), BP/AP 4050 (Articulation), BP/AP 4106 (Nursing), BP/AP 4220 (Standards of Scholarships), and BP/AP 4260 (Prerequisites and Co-requisites). (IV.A.4)

As illustrated in the board policies, administrative procedures and CPC Handbook, the college has the structure for inclusion of all relevant and appropriate perspectives in their decision-making in a timely and effective manner. The College has developed an integrated planning calendar that documents the frequency and duration of the planning cycles for each of the College's plans and related operations to assist with timely review and decision-making. Curriculum and Student Learning Outcomes are reviewed on a five-year cycle to ensure regular and timely assessment. (IV.A.5)

The College has evaluated its processes and structure to realign documents and committees for better communication and effectiveness. The revitalized Assessment of Planning and Outcomes Subcommittee, creation of the End-User Data Committee, Chair Council, and Outreach and Training Committee demonstrate this. College of the Desert documents their decision-making processes and decisions in appropriate agendas and minutes. Committee documentation is communicated through the College portal and on the committee webpage. Committees use standard minutes and agenda templates for consistency. The Outreach and Training Subcommittee communicates decision-making processes to the College community and the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Research communicates timelines, program review, planning, and prioritization dates for the College. College communications are established not only by electronic means but also through departments meetings and other committee meetings. Visiting team interviews with leadership of the different constituency groups confirmed that there is sufficient information sharing and communication of actions taken by the various committees. (IV.A.6)

Evidence confirmed that the College's governance processes, as well as its policies and procedures, are regularly reviewed and evaluated through annual self-evaluations, including annual program review updates, comprehensive program review), self-assessment of governance

committees, and the annual faculty and equipment prioritization processes. The governance committee self-evaluation is a relatively new process, developed and implemented in fall 2014, and one full round of assessment completed in spring 2017. Based on the outcomes of this assessment, the College made significant changes to improve institutional effectiveness. A variety of methods are used to communicate evaluation results: through PRU reports to deans and directors, through various facilities management processes, through the Assessment of Planning and Outcomes Subcommittee, which makes recommendations to the College Planning Council. (IV.A.7)

Conclusions
The College meets Standard IV.A.

Recommendations for Compliance
None.

Recommendations for Improvement
None.

Standard IV.B: Chief Executive Officer

General Observations

The superintendent/president is the Chief Executive Officer of the College and is empowered in this role through Board Policy 2430. The superintendent/president has primary responsibility for the quality of the institution, is actively engaged in the institution, and provides leadership in planning, organizing, and budgeting, as well as selecting and developing personnel and assessment of institutional effectiveness. The superintendent/president has placed a high priority on the accreditation visit and participated as an active member of the College accreditation team. The superintendent/president reports to the Board of Trustees and is evaluated annually. The superintendent/president works through an established participatory governance structure and, as chair of the College Planning Council, assures that the College's policies and practices are consistent with the mission. The superintendent/president is actively engaged in the community and maintains partnerships with public and private entities throughout the Coachella Valley.

Findings and Evidence

The superintendent/president has held office since 2012. Review of the evidence presented, combined with interviews with senior administrators and college personnel confirm that the president provides leadership within a well-established shared governance system. The president leads the operational and institutional efforts of the college, oversees the development of institutional goals, ensures efficient management of resources, and ensures that planning, decision-making, and budgeting processes align. The president has regular meetings with the vice presidents and College Planning Council. A review of College faculty and staff prioritization processes and hiring procedures confirms the president is involved in both the prioritization process and the final selection of administrators, full-time faculty, and key staff. (IV.B.I)

The team confirmed that the administrative organization is appropriately staffed and organized relative to the purpose, size, and complexity of the institution. Evidence supports that the

superintendent/president plans, oversees, and evaluates the administrative structure. Since his arrival, the superintendent/president has approved several reorganizations of the major divisions of the college. He has made changes to the managerial and reporting structures to improve service to students. The number of administrative and classified staffing positions has grown over the past few years to reflect and support student enrollment growth. Evidence and interviews confirmed that hiring processes follow the annual program planning and prioritization process. Interviews with college administrators confirm that the president delegates responsibility and authority as appropriate. (IV.B.2)

The team verified that the College superintendent/president utilizes established policies and procedures that guide institutional improvement efforts and establishes an integrated planning and resource allocation process that supports student achievement and learning. The College has a strong participatory governance process that has improvement of the teaching and learning environment as a core goal. As confirmed by evidence and interviews, the superintendent/president leads the College in strategic planning, including recent review of the mission statement, and development of a strategic plan and educational master plan, which include specific goals related to teaching and learning and student success. As Chair of College Planning Council, the superintendent/president directs the subcommittees that review and recommend the institutional set standards and that review, monitor, and recommend annual budget and resource allocation priorities. The superintendent/president invested resources to create the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Research, which has expanded the focus on data and data analysis, and strengthened the tie between data analysis and integrated planning. (IV.B.3)

Board Policy 3200 and Administrative Procedure 3200 assigns primary responsibility for the accreditation process to the president. Evidence supports that the superintendent/president embraces his leadership role for accreditation through his supervision and regular meetings with the Accreditation Liaison Officer, participation on the accreditation team, work as co-chair of Standard IV, and regular updates on accreditation to the Board of Trustees. The superintendent/president appropriately delegates responsibility for accreditation to the Accreditation Liaison Officer (ALO). In addition, interviews and evidence support that faculty, staff, and administration leaders have active responsibility for assuring compliance with accreditation requirements through accreditation training, the participatory governance process, and preparation of the institutional self-study report. (IV.B.4)

The president assumes primary responsibility for ensuring consistent implementation of board policies, statutes, and regulations through work with the Board of Trustees and leadership on College Planning Council. Following Board Policy 2410, the superintendent/president leads a robust process that ensures systematic review of policies and procedures on a five-year cycle. Interviews confirmed that the superintendent/president works closely with the vice president of administrative services to control the budget and expenditures to conform to the mission of the college. The budget is monitored through internal controls, including review by The College Planning Council Budget Subcommittee. (IV.B.5)

The superintendent/president engages and actively participates in the community served by the college and its satellite locations. Interviews and evidence demonstrate that the superintendent/president builds and maintains partnerships with a variety of organizations and

local community members, which have led to specific partnerships or college support, such as the donation of a research-quality telescope and Roadrunner Radio station. The superintendent/president serves on several boards, hosts events on campus, and meets with city council members, and key educational and community leaders. He communicates with the external community via press releases and a State of the College event. Evidence and interviews confirmed that the president communicates with the college through a variety of methods; including fall and spring flex sessions, college-wide emails such as faculty prioritization and "Dear Colleague" updates, as well as an annual State of the College address. (IV.B.6)

Conclusions

The College meets Standard IV.B.

Recommendation for Compliance
None.

Recommendation for Improvement
None.

Standard IV.C

General Observations

College of the Desert has a locally elected Board of Trustees that has the authority, and has adopted the necessary policies, to assure the proper operations and financial stability of the College/District. Through the work of the Board, carried out at regular Board meetings, the Trustees monitor academic quality, integrity, institutional effectiveness, and fiscal stability. The Board has standing agenda topics that cover the key areas of the college to support their knowledge and monitoring of College activities and recommendations. The Board is engaged in the oversight of the college, and actively advocates for the College within the surrounding communities.

Evidence and Findings

The governing board includes five members elected by voters and a student trustee elected by the student body, following Board Policies 2010 and 2100. Board Policy 2200 codifies the duties and responsibilities of the Board of Trustees. The Board also follows a variety of policies that outline their responsibilities related to accreditation, student equity, student conduct, budget preparation, and budget management. College administrators implement the rules through creation of Administrative Procedures. The Board establishes sub-committees as needed; however, most of their review and discussion is conducted during regular Board meetings and special sessions. The Board of Trustees assures the academic quality, integrity, efficiency, and fiscal stability through regular board meetings, with specific topics included on the agenda each month such as Student Learning, along with regular reports such as budget and accreditation that help them monitor the work of the College. (IV.C.1, ER 7)

The Board holds regularly scheduled meetings that allow for public comment and administrative updates on agenda items. A review of the Board meeting minutes reflects that the Board of Trustees follows Board Policy 2715, acting collectively on all matters. Through interviews and evidence, the team confirmed that the Board holds healthy, robust discussions during meetings and then comes together as a collective voice. The Board has several Board Policies to guide their behavior as a board, with detailed descriptions regarding the process to follow in a variety of circumstances, such as quorum, speakers, decorum, or emergency sessions. The Board is active and engaged during meetings and within the community, as evidenced by their monthly trustee reports. The Trustees act in a respectful manner in all interactions with administrators, staff, students, and the public. Board policies, meeting agendas, and meeting minutes are available on the College website. (IV.C.2)

Board Policy 2431, CEO Selection, establishes a search process to fill the superintendent/president position as necessary. In 2012, the Board of Trustees followed this process to hire superintendent/presidentBoard minutes document the process and confirm that a search firm was hired, a comprehensive job announcement with steps for applying was used, there were four final candidates from the process, and the current president was selected. Evidence confirmed that the Board of Trustees also follows Board Policy 2435, which requires the board to conduct an annual evaluation of the superintendent/president. The annual evaluation includes a self-assessment, an update of goals for the following year, and a feedback meeting with the Board. Board minutes reflect that the feedback session is held during closed session at a regularly scheduled Board meeting. (IV.C.3)

The board has five elected members from local areas, plus a student trustee who is elected by students. The student has an advisory vote. Board Policy 2200 outlines the duties and responsibilities of Board members, Board Policy 2015 outlines the role and responsibility of the Student Trustee, and Board Policy 2430 delegates authority for college decision-making to the superintendent/president. The Board holds regularly scheduled meetings that allow for public comment on general and specific agenda items. Board members receive information and data prior to Board meetings to help them prepare for pending actions. A review of Board meeting minutes demonstrates that Board members advocate for the College and are actively engaged in promoting the College to the greater community. The team confirmed through interviews that the Board reflects the public interest and defends the College from undue influence or political pressure. (IV.C.4, ER 7)

Board Policy 2200 outlines Board duties and responsibilities and Board Policy 2410 codifies board policies and administrative procedures. Review of the Board minutes confirmed that the Board sets and updates policies consistent with the District's mission. The Board recently approved an updated Mission Statement. Through review of Board minutes and interviews with Board members and the superintendent/president, the team verified that members of the Board of Trustees adhere to the roles and responsibilities outlined in board policy and provide oversight for educational quality, legal matters, and financial integrity. (IV.C.5)

The Board consists of five members, elected by qualified voters of the District. Board Policies 2010, 2200, 2210, 2310, and 2330 describe board membership, duties, responsibilities, officers of the board, regular meetings of the board, quorum, and voting. (IV.C.6)

The Board of Trustees follows Board Policy 2410 regarding the adoption, revision, or deletion of policies and procedures. A review of the board policies shows that the College follows a five-

year cycle of review, with a few reviewed more frequently to adjust for changes in legislation, accreditation requirements, or other emerging issues. The policies follow a formal college participatory governance review process before being forwarded to the Board. This process is documented on the Board Policy for historical record. Board meeting minutes show that the board reviews a variety of Board Policies at each meeting, as part of the ongoing review process. All policies and procedures are accessible to the public via the College website. (IV.C.7)

Review of the Board agendas and minutes from regular Board meetings, revealed that the Board monitors student learning and achievement through regular reports on topics including Student Success Scorecard, Educational Master Plan, Student Equity Plan, and Academic Programs and Job Projections. Student Learning is a standing monthly Board agenda item that includes the regular review and approval of curriculum. (IV.C.8)

Through interviews and evidence, the team determined that the Board participates in ongoing training through Board study sessions, conference attendance, board retreats, online training sessions, and guest speakers. The Board provides new member training. The Board of Trustees is comprised of five members, each serving a four-year term. Per Board Policy 2100, trustee elections are staggered every two years, with approximately half of the trustees elected during each election. Board Policy 2110 outlines the process for replacing a trustee in the case of a vacancy and the team confirmed that the Board follows this process. (IV.C.9)

Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 2745 define the process for Board self-evaluation. The Board conducts an annual self-evaluation and identifies opportunities to improve their own effectiveness. Per the Administrative Procedure, the self-evaluation process includes self-evaluations completed by each Board member, compiled results discussed at the March Board meeting, and results used to set annual goals. Review of the Board minutes confirmed that the Board follows this process. Interviews with the Board of Trustees and the superintendent/president confirmed that, based on the 2016 Board self-evaluation discussion, the Board implemented improvements related to Board input on strategic planning and additional training for new trustees; based on the 2017 self-evaluation the Board increased their professional development activities. (IV.C.10)

The Board of Trustees adheres to Board Policies 2715 and 2710 regarding board member code of ethics and conflict of interest. Through interviews and evidence, the team determined that there have been no violations of these policies. (IV.C.11, ER 7)

The Board has adopted and complies with Board Policy 2430 that delegates executive responsibility to the superintendent/president for administering policies and executing decisions requiring administrative action. The Board complies with Board Policy 2435 regarding the evaluation of the superintendent/president, with an annual process that holds the superintendent/president accountable through annual evaluations and ongoing communication with the Board. (IV.C.12)

Updates and presentations at Board of Trustees meetings inform the Board about accreditation. Board members have completed a variety of training sessions, including completion of the ACCJC online accreditation training, attendance at conferences and workshops to learn about accreditation, and participation in writing a portion of the self-study. Evidence shows that the Board of Trustees reviews and approves all accreditation reports. (IV.C.13)

Conclusions

The Board of Trustees is dedicated to supporting the mission of the College. Through the Board's support of the superintendent/president and its community engagement, the Board plays an important role in assisting the College in becoming a center for educational enrichment and economic development in the Coachella Valley and surrounding communities.

The College meets Standard IV.C and ERs 1 and 7.

Recommendations for Compliance

None.

Recommendations for Improvement

None.

College of the Desert
2017 Institutional Self Evaluation Report
Quality Focus Essay

The Quality Focus Essay (QFE) was the result of introspective and continuous effort over the course of preparation of the Institutional Self Evaluation Report by College of the Desert. The QFE provides the College with two long-term plans to improve student learning and achievement, and professional development. The action projects have identified outcomes, both measurable and achievable, identified responsible parties and groups, and set a reasonable timeline.

The first Action Project for the College focuses on systemic integration of learning outcomes, assessment, and program review in the Prioritization and Planning Process. Project 1 of the QFE appears relevant and consistent with the ISER. It is clear from the evidence provided that COD worked together to develop the project based on an honest assessment of their progress on assessing student learning. Action Project 1 is the "Systematic Integration of Learning Outcomes, Assessment, and Program Review in Prioritization and Planning Process." There are five goals associated with this project:
1. Review and revision of course Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs)
2. Revision of the program SLOs to match with a revised definition of program by the college
3. Consolidate the program review process to minimize overlap and redundancy between the comprehensive and annual program review processes.
4. Identify a tool to facilitate campus-wide assessment and reporting of SLOs
5. Evaluate the success of QFE #1 goals.

It is anticipated that these goals will be accomplished by the spring of 2020. The goals have been assigned to the Outcomes and Assessment Committee, the two OAC Coordinators, the Office of Student Learning, and the Office of Institutional Research and Planning.

The visiting team agrees that this Action Project is an important project to be accomplished by College of the Desert. The college has done well in analyzing their own needs. The team suggests that it may be difficult to accomplish the ambitious set of tasks they have set for themselves within the timeline they have developed. There is a substantial number of tasks to be accomplished during the next 3 years. It may not be possible to get 100% of their course and Program SLOs revised and assessed within the next year, as listed in the timeline. The team suggests that the College might focus on revising a pilot set of program SLOs and go through an assessment cycle before rolling out the task to the entire college, or they might consider slightly extending the timeline for college-wide completion. That would allow greater time for reflection and improvement of the process. The task of selecting and implementing a new system to capture assessment data might also take longer than expected.

The second Action Project seeks to increase staff, faculty, and leadership participation in relevant professional development opportunities by providing comprehensive and coordinated professional development opportunities for all college employees. The timeline for the proposed initiative is two years. In the first year, college constituencies, under the direction of the Vice President for Human Resources will identify a plan for submission to the College Planning

Council regarding a Professional Development Process or Plan that serves all personnel. In the second year, a professional development workgroup will create a calendar for professional development activities and implement the planned activities. In the third year, the College will evaluate the effectiveness of the new professional development program.

The proposal is viable and would greatly enhance College of the Desert's overall professional development.